

SECOND MARSH HERITAGE RESEARCH REPORT



Prepared for

**Development Services Department
City of Oshawa**

Prepared by

**Martindale Planning Services
Heritage Consultants**

October 2020

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1.0	Introduction	1
2.0	Description of the Property	
2.1	General Overview and Defining Characteristics	1
2.2	Legal Description	2
3.0	Historical and Cultural Significance of the Site	
3.1	Early History of Oshawa	3
3.2	Historic Context: Adjacent Sites.....	3
4.0	Archaeological Significance	5
5.0	Description of Owners from 1790 to 1952	7
6.0	Second Marsh Timeline	14
7.0	Significant Studies and Plans	15
7.1	Oshawa Second Marsh Baseline Study, Cecile, 1983.....	15
7.2	Second Marsh Management Plan (1992) and Draft Oshawa Second Marsh Background Report (2018).....	16
7.3	Draft 2011 Oshawa Waterfront Master Plan.....	17
8.0	Second Marsh Defense Association and Friends of Second Marsh	18
9.0	Evaluation of the Site Against Ontario Regulation 9/06	20
10.0	Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest	
10.1	Description of the Property	21
10.2	Statement of Cultural Heritage Value	21
10.3	Description of Heritage Attributes	22
11.0	Potential to Designate Second Marsh as a Cultural Heritage Landscape...23	
12.0	McLaughlin Bay Wildlife Reserve	25
13.0	Recommendations	26

Appendix 'A' – Sources Consulted

Appendix 'B' – Chain of Title

Appendix 'C' – Inventory of Species and Threats

Appendix 'D' – Heritage Oshawa Recommendations (2008)

Figure 1 – Location Map

Figure 2 – Aerial Photograph

Figure 3 – Historical and Current Images of the Property

Figure 4 – Land Ownership Map, 1992 Second Marsh Management Plan

Second Marsh Research Report

1.0 Introduction

In 2008, Heritage Oshawa adopted a recommendation recognizing the Second Marsh for its contextual and historical contributions to the story of the development of Oshawa, for a number of reasons (which are spelled out in Appendix 'C' to this report), and proposing that the Marsh be added to the City of Oshawa Register of Properties of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest. Council subsequently agreed to include Second Marsh in the Inventory as a non-designated, listed property.

On February 18, 2020 the City of Oshawa Council decided to seek the services of a consultant to prepare a heritage research report for the Second Marsh. The primary purpose of the report was to provide detailed information on the site and to evaluate the site against Ontario Regulation 9/06, which sets out the provincial criteria for determining cultural heritage value and Interest. According to staff report no. DS-20-31, the information will be used to prepare a designation by-law to be passed by City Council in order to finalize the designation. At the same meeting, Council decided to initiate a heritage research report for Lakeview Park in recognition of its 100th anniversary.

On March 18, 2020 the City retained *Martindale Planning Services* to prepare research reports for Lakeview Park and the Second Marsh.

2.0 Description of the Property

2.1 General Overview and Defining Characteristics

Oshawa's Second Marsh is one of the last, largest (at 137 ha), and most biodiverse coastal wetlands on the Great Lakes. It has been identified as a Provincially Significant Wetland (P.S.W.) and a Provincially Significant Area of Natural and Scientific Interest (A.N.S.I.), and in 2009 was listed on Oshawa's Inventory of Heritage Properties. The provincial designation requires the protection of the Marsh's natural and cultural heritage features, biodiversity, and the provision of compatible recreation—in this case, passive recreation: walking, hiking, photography, and birding.

A wetland ecosystem is one of the most biologically diverse and ecologically rich. In addition to its role as essential habitat for local species and a stopover for migratory species, the Marsh is an essential site for water-quality improvement, acting as a natural water purifier and flood-mitigation system. Wetlands play a vital role in the Great Lakes ecosystem by:

- Providing critical ecological functions and habitat for plant and animal populations
- Serving as a major source of oxygen
- Capturing and retaining eroded sediments in runoff

Second Marsh Research Report

- Providing flood storage capacity
- Act as carbon sinks to reduce the impact of green-house emissions and climate change

In addition to its ecological functions, the Marsh has had an important historic role in the development of the City of Oshawa, marking the ancient terminus of the Indigenous Scugog Carrying Place Trail, and later becoming a site of booming industry in the 19th century, and finally a restored natural heritage site, an area for citizens of Oshawa to learn about the importance of wetlands and to access opportunities for passive recreation.

The Second Marsh is adjacent to several important historic, natural, and recreational areas, including the McLaughlin Bay Wildlife Reserve, Darlington Provincial Park, the Scugog Carrying Place Trail, the Great Lakes Waterfront Trail, the Joseph Kolodzie Oshawa Creek Bike Path, historic Gifford Hill, Lakeview Park, the Oshawa Harbour operated by the Hamilton-Oshawa Port Authority (HOPA), the nearby Pumphouse Marsh and Gold Point wetlands, and the new Ed Broadbent Waterfront Park. Like the Marsh, these nearby landmarks represent the historic importance and character of the area and emphasize how the Marsh supports and is physically and historically linked to its surroundings.

2.2 Legal Description

The legal description of the area of Second Marsh to be designated** is as follows:

Pt. W1/2 & NE ¼ Lot 2 Concession Broken Front East Whitby; Pt. SE Pt. Lot 2 Concession Broken Front East Whitby; Pt. SE Pt. Lot 2 Concession Broken Front East Whitby as in D415999 (Firstly); Oshawa, being PIN 26938-0012 (LT); and,

Road Allowance between Lots 2 & 3 Concession Broken Front East Whitby; road allowance between Lots 4 & 5 Concession Broken Front East Whitby; Pt. Lot 3 Concession Broken Front East Whitby; Pt. Lot 4 Concession Broken Front East Whitby; Pt. Lot 5 Concession Broken Front East Whitby as in * OS66363, OS69070*, OS70876, D415999 (Secondly) Pts. 2 & 3, 40R16881, Pts. 1, 3 & 5, 40R6375, Pt. 1, 40R15761 S. of Colonel Sam Dr., E. of EW19461, D363463 except Pts. 2 & 3, 40R15761, Pt. 3, Exprop. Pl. 149, D119084, D460774, Pt. 1, 40R16155, Pts. 1* & 4*, 40R4996, Pt. 1, 40R1446, Harbour Road, Oshawa; S/T D16235, D16974E; Oshawa, being PIN 16378-0053 (LT); and,

East Whitby Concession BF Pt. Lot 4 RP 40R6375 Part 4, Oshawa.

- Amended 2002 0126 by W. Griffin * This description may not be acceptable in future registrations, please see Land Registrar
- ****Added 2002 01 26 by W. Griffin S/T Ease in Gross over LT Lot 4, BFC, Pts. 1 & 2, PL 40R23839 as in DR48148

**Please see section 7.2 and 12.0 concerning this description.

Second Marsh Research Report

3.0 Historical and Cultural Significance of the Site

3.1 Early History of Oshawa

The north shore of Lake Ontario has been the seasonal home to Indigenous people for many thousands of years. Early European surveyors and mapmakers, as well as fur traders, recognized the area near today's Oshawa Harbour, operated by the Hamilton-Oshawa Port Authority, as marking the southern end of the Scugog Carrying Place Trail, a significant ancient portage route connecting lake trade with the resource-rich northern interior.

On orders from the surveyor general of Upper Canada, Augustus Jones surveyed Whitby Township in 1795, mapping the Trail, which begins slightly east of Oshawa Harbour alongside the bay that would become Second Marsh. In his field notes, Jones records "Wilson's" to mark the land, now known as Gifford Hill, belonging to Captain Benjamin Wil(I)son, one of the area's first European settlers, and notes that the point where the Oshawa and Farewell Creeks emptied into the lake was called by the First Nations people *Min-ce-nan-quash*.

In February, 1819, Wilson received a grant from the Crown of 200 acres (81 ha) of "lot 4," immediately to the west of the Second Marsh (then a bay), and within a few years, other pioneers had joined him in the area.

By the early 1800s, a gradual increase in settlers led to the construction of saw and grist mills and to a viable shipping and shipbuilding infrastructure for exporting local products—all centred around the harbour area, which was at the time called the First Marsh. Local businessmen such as the Farewell brothers dammed the creeks feeding the Second Marsh and harbour to build mills, asheries, and tanneries. The construction of what would become Simcoe Street in 1822 provided improved access to the northern interior and an additional southern route for goods to reach Sydenham (Oshawa) Harbour.

By 1836, the settlement of Skae's Corners had grown up around the intersection of Simcoe Street and the "Danforth Road" (now Highway 2/King St). The settlement's name was changed to "Oshawa" in 1842, and in 1850, the Village of Oshawa was incorporated. In 1879, the community, now an industrial centre and the new home of the McLaughlin Carriage Company, became a town, and on March 8, 1924, it was granted city status.

3.2 Historic Context: Adjacent Historical Sites

Like Lakeview Park and the present-day Harbour area, the Second Marsh and land surrounding it played a critical historic role in the development of this area in particular, and of Oshawa in general. The combination of the Scugog Carrying Place and the

Second Marsh Research Report

adjacent creeks feeding the First and Second Marshes created a setting for early trade and Oshawa's industrial growth and settlement, as demonstrated by the following historic sites.

The Scugog Carrying Place Trail

This ancient north–south Indigenous “highway” carried goods and people from the lakeshore to the interior, Lake Scugog, and beyond. In Grant Karcich's *Scugog Carrying Place*, he locates the southern terminus of the Trail at a sandy beach “near the creek [Farewell] just east of Benjamin Wilson's homestead,” along the west edge of the Second Marsh. Archaeological finds suggest that a succession of Indigenous groups used the trail and the Marsh seasonally to fish, hunt, and gather supplies for trading along the north shore of Lake Ontario.

Not only did it connect Lake Ontario to Lake Scugog, Lake Simcoe, the Trent River system and Georgian Bay, Karcich says the Trail “helped define the location of early settlements and shaped present-day communities.”

The Wilson Site and *Cabane de Plomb*

Oral histories of Oshawa often mention the mysterious *Cabane de Plomb*, supposedly an abandoned “French trading post” at the foot of the Carrying Place Trail in which Oshawa's “first settler,” Benjamin Wilson, sheltered before building his own home. In November, 2005, an Oshawa resident proposed that the city erect plaques commemorating the Oshawa section of the Scugog Carrying Place Trail as well as the *Cabane* as both were significant to Oshawa's history. However, plans for a *Cabane* plaque were suspended when additional information gathered by Grant Karcich in researching his book on the Carrying Place suggested that the evidence in the original documentation was purely circumstantial.

Most of the stories related to the *Cabane* can be traced back to the d'Anville map of 1755 that locates a “*Cabane de Plomb*” somewhere between the present-day Humber and Ganaraska Rivers (i.e., between Toronto and Port Hope). In fact, the earliest French map-makers often used French names in place of the actual Indigenous names, so the notation may even have indicated a late-17th-century Iroquoian village, not a trading post at all. In addition, the small scale of these early maps means it is impossible to precisely identify a location, and with no archaeological evidence of an Indigenous settlement in this area of the shore, it is likely the *Cabane* was somewhere else altogether.

It is more likely, as Karcich states, that Benjamin Wilson's temporary shelter was a structure built by a French fur trader in the late 1700s near the mouth of Farewell Creek at the Second Marsh, likely the intrepid Jean Baptiste Rousseau, who was noted as the inhabitant of a cabin “on the front of” lot 4 (the lot alongside Second Marsh, later

Second Marsh Research Report

granted to Wilson) by surveyor Augustus Jones in 1791. (It is unlikely this structure would still have been habitable if it were a French fort built in the late 1600s.) Unfortunately, Rousseau's trading post and the *Cabane* have become commingled over time in the local oral histories, and the exact location of the trading post remains unknown, but there is no doubt that some type of cabin built for seasonal trade at the lakeshore sheltered one of Oshawa's earliest European settlers. Since the publication of *Scugog Carrying Place*, Karcich has found additional information suggesting that the Rousseau site may have been further east than Gifford Hill, closer to the Third Marsh (now called McLaughlin Bay).

Gifford Hill

The Oshawa Harbour Urban Design Study (1995) promoted the Harbour as a vibrant "centrepiece" of the waterfront while attempting to minimize incompatibilities between industrial port operations and non-industrial activities. The Study included the historic Gifford Hill. The Harbour Area plan was the subject of an Ontario Municipal Board Hearing in the mid-1990s. As a result of that hearing, an urban design concept and related guidelines for the Gifford Farm area adjacent to the Second Marsh were approved by the Ontario Municipal Board in 1996, including the requirement that a perimeter buffer of 120 m is maintained.

This document outlined the uses and form of development considered appropriate for the Gifford Hill site, first home of Benjamin Wilson and original site of the Pioneer Cemetery. Key features of the urban design concept included:

- An earthen berm to act as a buffer on the eastern edge of the site, adjacent to Second Marsh;
- Use of the area west of the buffer for certain prestige industrial and office uses, cultural and community uses and open space and recreation uses;
- Controlling the height and siting of buildings to preserve views and vistas to and from the area; and,
- Establishing a heritage and commemorative site at the crest of Gifford Hill.

4.0 Archaeological Significance

Designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* is particularly warranted for properties with high potential for archaeological significance. The proven history of the original settlers of Oshawa and the Carrying Place Trail qualify the Second Marsh as such a property.

Oshawa and its environs have provided rich treasure-hunting grounds for student and professional archaeologists, as several digs in the area affirm. In 1967, the MacLeod site, a Lake Ontario Iroquois village dating from 1450 A.D. was discovered on the

Second Marsh Research Report

property of Howard MacLeod at the corner of Thornton and Rossland Road. It is one of the earliest known settlements in the Oshawa area.

Subsequently, in 1992, the Grandview site, near Grandview and Taunton, was discovered, unveiling a new First Nations village and yielding thousands of artifacts, many of which are now on display in the Grandview Gallery at the Oshawa Museum's Robinson House, helping to tell the story of the Lake Ontario Iroquois who called this area home.

Jim Richards, founder of the Friends of Second Marsh, recalls a number of archaeological investigations along the barrier beach and below the bluffs of Gifford Hill in the 1960s and 70s by teams from the Royal Ontario Museum and the University of Toronto, who reportedly found artifacts 8–10 feet (3 m) down the bluffs: pottery, arrowheads, and leather items from the French trading post era. More research is required to locate these studies.

Local farmers and landowners, including Lewis Beaton, who owned the dairy farm now occupied by the General Motors Canada headquarters and ran Beaton Dairy, described finding pottery on the property. In addition, the Gifford brothers, Lyman (keen historian and mayor of Oshawa 1958–1966) and Hiram, whose farm was on the west side of the Marsh, reported to Richards that they would find artifacts on and around Gifford Hill, site of Wilson's homestead.

In his *Scugog Carrying Place*, Grant Karcich notes, "The Wilson site was registered with the Ontario Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Sport and designated as AIGq-46 in the provincial archaeological registry, part of Ontario's database of protected archaeological sites." (p. 201–202)

This potentially valuable archaeological site, immediately adjacent to Second Marsh, has suffered not just from neglect but also from wanton destruction by its owners, Karcich says:

During the fall and winter of 2009–2010 there was further dredging of the harbour. The extracted material was trucked to Gifford Hill and dumped in a massive mound on Harbour Commission land lying next to the Second Marsh. Heavy-duty vehicles carrying the waste material drove across a portion of the adjacent Wilson property and cut deeply into the top layers of earth on the historical site while en route to depositing their loads. The Ontario ministry responsible for the site alerted the Commission to the damage being done to the Wilson site, and in January 2010, after two months of heavy construction traffic over the Wilson site, the Commission completed the berm and spread construction debris of brick, stone, and concrete over the site.

On February 23, 2011, the City of Oshawa passed a motion recommending that an archaeological study of the Second Marsh and Gifford Hill be considered as part of

Second Marsh Research Report

the city's Waterfront Master Plan. However, since Gifford Hill belonged to the Oshawa Harbour Commission, as a federal agency it is not subject to the municipal decision. A controversy has been brewing since 2006, when the Harbour Commission began its efforts to accommodate a private company called FarmTech Energy Corporation, which is proposing to construct an ethanol plant at Gifford Hill....The ministry...ordered FarmTech to conduct a comprehensive archaeological investigation of the site. As of publication [2013], a full archaeological report has yet to be released on the Wilson site. It remains unknown whether much of the site was left on Gifford Hill, or if during the creation of the huge berms of harbour-dredged soil deposited on the Wilson site, it was destroyed.

Some of the opposition to the harbour dredging in 2009–2010 and the proposed ethanol plant at Gifford Hill stems from potential negative effects on the neighbouring Second Marsh waterfowl, the potential of pollution, and the loss of a community-planned waterfront. (p. 203–204)

5.0 Description of Owners from 1790 to 1952 (when the property* was transferred to the City)

*Please note that the Second Marsh area comprises several lots in the Broken Front concession, including Lots 1, 2, 3, 4 and 5, each of which was successively divided over time. Therefore, for clarity, the following owners are presented chronologically, rather than by lot or lot portion. The details of lot ownership may be found in the chain of title documents in Appendix 'B.'

Crown transfer to Lieutenant (later Colonel) James Givins, March, 1790

James Givins (1759–1846), who signed his name “Givens” early in his career, was an army and militia officer who served under the lieutenant governor of Detroit, where he learned the Ojibwa language, as well as under Lieutenant Governor John Graves Simcoe and General Isaac Brock. He was likely born in Ireland, and came to Canada after fighting on the British side during the American Revolution. In 1791 he was commissioned in the Queen's Rangers, commanded by Simcoe in Upper Canada. During the War of 1812, he was highly commended for the courageous manner in which, along with a small company of Mississaugas, he defended York against American invaders during an attack in April, 1813.

He served in the Indian Department in Upper Canada for many years following the war, and was Chief Superintendent from 1830–1837. He died in March, 1846, at 87, and is buried in St. James Cemetery, Toronto.

It is likely that, like many other faithful military officers and United Empire Loyalists, Givins was granted the standard Crown grant of 200 acres (81 ha) as a reward for his

Second Marsh Research Report

service, and possibly never visited his Oshawa property. He apparently was also granted a 200-acre lot in York, which he sold to Moody Farewell in 1804.

Crown transfer to Capt. Benjamin Wil(l)son, February, 1819–June, 1819

In 1763, at the conclusion of the Seven Years War, France ceded New France to Britain. After the treaty was signed, Upper Canada, now Ontario, saw a steady influx of new settlers from the United Kingdom and the United States. Captain Benjamin Wilson (c. 1732–1821) was one of the many who left the United States following the Revolutionary War to settle in Upper Canada. Wilson and his party arrived in 1794 and they are recorded as being the first settlers in Oshawa. Wilson apparently occupied an old French trading post until he built a home and barn on Gifford Hill, immediately adjacent to the Second Marsh. On this same land, the first interments of the area's settlers took place, in what is now known as the Port Oshawa Pioneer Cemetery, relocated in 1975 to the west end of Lakeview Park. The original interments included Wilson's own in 1851. There were 195 individuals interred there when the cemetery was moved in 1975. There were, however, only 60 headstones.

Wilson, originally from Massachusetts, likely arrived at Gifford Hill and the southern terminus of the Carrying Place Trail at the Second Marsh with a small group around 1793, once Lieutenant Governor John Graves Simcoe had founded York (now Toronto) and began assisting immigrants. Wilson received a grant of 200 acres (81 ha) from the Crown in February, 1819, and within a few years, other pioneers had joined him in the area, including Roger Conant and Charles Annis, who settled nearby. Wilson brought his second wife, Elizabeth (née Lockwood, ??–1840), who had earlier survived being taken captive by First Nations people in Pennsylvania, two sons (possibly the John and George Wilson listed in the chain of title) and a step-son. In 1793, Wilson's daughter, Nancy (1793–1854), was born, reportedly the first white child born in Whitby Township. Nancy would later marry William Pickell (see below) and emigrate with him to Wisconsin in 1842 following the death of her mother, Elizabeth.

In *Scugog Carrying Place*, Karcich notes: "Many records show that the children of the first American settlers often relocated to the United States after they came of age, drawn by a combination of religious leanings, remaining ties to relatives south of the border, and new farming opportunities."

William Pickell, 1819–1830

Benjamin Wilson sold his land to his son-in-law, William Pickell, in 1819. The Pickell branch of the family came to Canada in 1782 from the Mohawk Valley in New York State. They were of German origin and members of the High Dutch Church. They entered the country in Quebec but later moved to Darlington Township near Oshawa.

Second Marsh Research Report

William Pickell (1790 [Vermont]–1876 [Iowa]) was married to Nancy Wilson (1793 [Whitby]–1845 [Wisconsin]). They were married on October 3, 1811, in Oshawa, ON. Together, they had ten children: John Middleton, Benjamin, Nelson, Chlorinda, Moses Wilson, Sarah Jane, David, William, Ann, and Daniel. In 1842, William Pickell, together with Charles Terwillegar and Nathan Harris and their spouses and dependant children left Whitby and moved to the United States. Nancy Pickell would die a few short years later. Some of the older Pickell children (John Middleton, Benjamin, Nelson, and Chlorinda) opted to stay in Whitby/Oshawa.

After Nancy's death in 1845, William married an Irish-born woman named Ann Bly (1812–?), with whom he had an additional four children (Clarissa, Charles, George, and John). Both William and Ann would remain in the USA for the remainder of their lives, both passing away in Iowa.

On the 1851 Canada Census, the surname for the Nelson Pickell family was recorded as "Pickle," and his occupation was listed as "farmer." He and his wife Cynthia (née Coryell) had four children at the time, and resided in Whitby.

William Farewell, 1830–1861

The Farewells are well known in Oshawa as one of the "founding families," memorialized by many natural and manufactured features, including Farewell St., Farewell Creek, Farewell Corners (the Village of Harmony), and the Farewell Pioneer Cemetery. The first Farewells to arrive in the area were brothers William and Acheus Moody Farewell (known as Moody and father of well-known businessman and political figure Abram Farewell), around 1802. The brothers were drawn to the area by the prospect of fur-trading along the Scugog Carrying Place, and quickly established a business travelling to Lakes Scugog and Simcoe along the Trail and trading with the Mississauga.

After fur-trading for a few years, William and Moody Farewell were involved in a dramatic series of events precipitated by the murder of their hired hand, John Sharp, at one of their trading posts on Lake Scugog in the spring of 1804. The accused was Ogetonicut, a member of the Muskrat branch of the Chippewa, and after determining that the appropriate jurisdiction for the trial was the Newcastle District, a party of the prisoner, the constable guarding him, and the judge and officers of the court, including some of the most prominent figures in law and politics in the small colony of Upper Canada, set out from York (Toronto) for the trial location aboard the *H.M.S. Speedy* against the will of its captain due to an oncoming storm and the unseaworthiness of the boat.

The vessel stopped at the Port of Oshawa to pick up the Farewell brothers and other witnesses, but the brothers refused to board the overloaded craft, taking their canoe

Second Marsh Research Report

instead. On the night of October the 8th the blizzard sealed the *Speedy's* fate, and it was lost near present-day Brighton with all passengers and crew. The incident had far-reaching consequences and was called “a disaster felt by the Bench, the Bar Society, the Legislature and the Country.”

After leaving the fur business in 1812, A.M. Farewell opened a tavern that was famous as a stop-over for British soldiers travelling between Montreal and York. Moody also operated mills powered by damming Farewell Creek, around which Farewell Corners (now Harmony and King Sts.) grew. Karcich continues: “By 1820, the entrepreneurial Farewell brothers had begun operating a potash and pearl ash works...The Farewells were very active in a multitude of commercial enterprises. Around 1835 the family built the schooner *Caledonia*, the first of their fleet of ships...J.E. Farewell described the... Second Marsh as deep enough for large-sized vessels.” (p. 145–146)

However, land clearing and development upstream meant a drop in water power in the two creeks supplying the harbour and Marsh, and with the power went the industry. By the mid-1800s, the Farewells were closing their mills and other businesses and joining the exodus to the growing village of Oshawa.

William Fulton Farewell (1779–1845) married Sarah Cornwall (1777–?) in 1806. William and Sarah had six children together: Alexander Moody, Amos, James, Cornwall, and two others (names unknown). It is assumed that after William's death, his estate continued to hold the land title until selling in 1861.

Crown transfer to Richard Woon, 1842–1876

Richard Woon (1806–1858) was a native of Cornwall, England. Interestingly, he has two grave markers, one (along with his wife) in the Pioneer Memorial Gardens Cemetery in Oshawa, and another with his family at Oshawa Union Cemetery. Many of his immediate family members also have individual grave markers at Pioneer Memorial as well.

Richard Woon was married to Barbara Hurd Woon of Peterborough (1820–1906), and together they had five children, one of whom died in infancy.

Richard Woon settled in Oshawa in 1834. He was the original owner of the Oshawa House Hotel (built in 1838), located at 62 King St W., Oshawa, now designated under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, as well as other properties in Oshawa's downtown core. He was a local merchant who also served as hotelkeeper at the Oshawa House from 1838–1850. Although he stepped down from the latter position in 1850, he continued to own the property until his death in 1858.

In Thomas Conant's *Upper Canada Sketches*, he describes Oshawa's only known duel having taken place in 1838 outside “Richard Woon's tavern” (the Oshawa House Hotel):

Second Marsh Research Report

The young man accused of stealing the cakes quickly made his way on horseback to the tavern operated by Mr. Richard Woon. It was here, at the south-west corner of Oshawa's Four Corners that the duel was to take place.

As the gentlemen positioned themselves at each end of the hotel's front porch, Captain Trull who had command of a few troops stationed in Oshawa, attempted to put an end to this foolishness. He placed one of his own men between the combatants in an attempt to prevent each of them from firing.

The idea was a good one, however, one of the young men just side-stepped the soldier and fired his weapon. While his bullet missed, his intended target was spooked and immediately threw down his weapon and ran for his life.

Interestingly, this was not the end of the duel. Capt. Trull, who worked hard to try and prevent the duel, found himself disgusted by the apparent cowardice of the man who ran away. The story goes that he quickly picked up the discarded pistol and ran after the young man intending to fire on him for being such a coward. (Courtesy of the Oshawa Museum)

It is not clear from the available records whether Richard Woon farmed his land or how he used it. After Woon's death, his estate continued to hold ownership of the Second Marsh property until 1876.

Samuel Phillips (owned for only one month) Jan–Feb 1876

Samuel Phillips (1827–1885) purchased the property from Richard Woon's estate. Phillips was also a native of Cornwall, England. He was married to Elizabeth Argall Phillips (1819–1899). They had (at least) one son and four daughters (as per census data). In the 1851 Canadian Census, Samuel Phillip's profession is listed as innkeeper, and both he and his wife Elizabeth are listed as Wesleyan Methodists. Later, in an 1871 census, Samuel's occupation is listed as "farmer."

The Phillips family grave marker is the largest and most detailed bronze memorial in Oshawa's Union Cemetery.

Samuel J. Hall, 1876–1906

Samuel Hall was a local businessman and prolific builder in the community, "establishing factories, saw mills, ... a store house and elevator at Port Oshawa, and a woolen mill north of the town" (Lisa Terech, Oshawa Museum).

Karcich reports in his *Scugog Carrying Place* that a "James Hall, possibly of the Halls of Susquehanna, acquired the [Eleazar] Lockwood lease on lot eight in 1823, but

Second Marsh Research Report

proceeded to settle on lots one and two around what today is known as the Second Marsh.” James was Samuel J. Hall’s father.

Hall owned a mill called The Woollen Factory, located just north of Oshawa. As a prominent businessman at what was then Skae’s Corners, Samuel Hall was one of the original signatories to the application for a charter for the Sydenham Harbour Company in September, 1841.

Sidney Samuel Brooks, 1906–1915

Sidney S. Brooks (1868–1939) was born in Courtice, ON, and was a well-travelled person with British roots. He was a well-known butcher, and in November of 1937 he had a number of his Rhode Island Red roosters stolen, to his dismay.

He was married to Aura Emmeline Brooks, née Hall (1872–1942), and settled in Courtice. Together they had four daughters (Gertrude May Hall Soules (1895–1929), Dorothea May Brooks Fitzsimmons (1905–?), Mrs. Alexander Wallace (?–?) and Margaret (no date, but she predeceased both parents), and two sons (Samuel Brooks (1892–1895) and Rae Sidney Brooks 1908–1983).

Sidney Brooks was known as a proficient hunter and sportsman, having been a charter member of the First Gun Club formed in Bowmanville in the 1890s. He was a member of the Jerusalem Lodge A.F. and A. M. (Masons), and the Ebenezer United Church. Sidney and Aura are interred together at the Ebenezer United Cemetery, Clarington.

Margaret Conant, 1905–1930

A member of another of the “pioneer families” of Oshawa, Margaret Conant (née Gifford), also owned property at the Marsh. Her ancestor (by marriage), Roger Conant, followed Benjamin Wilson here in 1794, and settled near Wilson’s homestead. He was a lifelong Oshawa resident. Born in Oshawa in 1846, she also died in Oshawa in 1920. She was married to Thomas Conant (1842–1905), Roger’s great-grandson, chronicler of early life in Whitby Township and former owner of Gifford Hill. Together they had five children (Alberta Gertrude Conant Baker (1870–1939), Edith Julia Conant Myers (1872–1950), Elizabeth May Conant Brethour (1874–1925), Horace T. Conant (1882–1889), and Gordon Daniel Conant (1885–1953)). All but one child lived to adulthood, as Horace died at age seven.

Their surviving son, Gordon Daniel Conant, became a notable public figure, serving as Mayor of Oshawa (1916–1917) and the twelfth Premier of Ontario. Gordon’s wife, Verna, was extremely active in the community, becoming Honorary president of the Oshawa General Hospital women’s auxiliary, the Women’s Institute, The Oshawa Historical

Second Marsh Research Report

Society, and the Girl Guides. She played an important role with the St. John Ambulance and received the title of Dame of the Order of St. John, and was instrumental in the founding in 1960 of the Sydenham Museum (now the Oshawa Museum).

The Conants' brick home (nicknamed the "Buenavista") was located at the corner of Wentworth and Simcoe Streets in Oshawa, but was torn down in 1985 to make way for a townhouse development. The Conant family has a large family marker at Oshawa's Union Cemetery, where many of the family are buried. Thomas Conant published two well-known works, *Upper Canada Sketches* (1898), and *Life in Canada* (1903). His writing covers a number of subjects, including family history, economic history, political history, and social history, and documents many of Oshawa's early facts and tales.

Per the Oshawa Museum:

Over the combined 40 chapters of his two books he relates: how land was cleared; the importance of trade and cordial relations with the Mississauga; the danger presented by packs of wolves; the impact of the War of 1812; tensions between those of American descent and more recent arrivals from Britain; the utility of Whitby's port; the influence of American religious movements such as Millerism and Mormonism; the price and productivity of land; the establishment and growth of local industries; the tyranny and downfall of the Family Compact; the importance of the Grand Trunk Railway; and, much more. His writing strongly conveys the risks faced and rewards received by those would-be Americans who by choice or by circumstance ended up here in Oshawa.

Samuel Vinson, 1915–1943

Samuel "Sam" Vinson was born in England, and came to Canada as a child. He married Irene Armour (of Darlington) on March 22, 1911. Both Sam and Irene came from farming families who resided near each other. Together, they had three children: Gordon A. Vinson (1913–2006), Mrs. Frank Morton Balson (Della Jean) (1916–2003) of Prestonvale, and Allan James Vinson (1918–2006) of Oshawa. They were members of the Ebenezer United Church. The entire Vinson family is buried at the Ebenezer United Church Cemetery in Courtice, ON.

John and Maude Victoria Ferguson, 1930–1952

John Ferguson died in 1966, and Maude Ferguson died in 1958. It is assumed that they were spouses. The conveyance documents suggest that perhaps John and Maude owned different parcels of their property, as John appears to have had his parcel expropriated by the city first, in 1951, while the remainder was expropriated from Maude in 1952, likely both to permit the construction of Highway 401, which crosses immediately north of the Marsh.

Second Marsh Research Report

Annie Levine, 1943–1950

On May 16, 1946, it was reported in *The Canadian Statesman* (Bowmanville, Ontario) that an arbitration was held before the Ontario Municipal Board in the matter of a claim by Mrs. Annie Levine for compensation for the new Highway 2A (now known as Highway 401) running through her owned lands, running from Toronto to Oshawa. Mrs. Levine was originally seeking \$34,500 in compensation for her farm of 169 acres (lots 1 and 2, Broken Front Concession, Township of East Whitby). Arbitration fixed it to a result of \$6500, with interest (as reported in *The Canadian Statesman* newspaper).

Annie Levine is possibly connected (by marriage) to the junior department store owner Samuel “Sammy” Levine, who was a well known shop keeper from the 1920s to the 1960s in Grimsby, Ontario. The Levine family placed great value on their faith and community. Sammy’s large store (initially called “The White Store,” later renamed Levine’s) was a family-run business, employing their children as well. In 1953, the family celebrated 32 years of being in business in Grimsby, as well as the marriage of one of their sons (Irving Levine).

6.0 Second Marsh Timeline

The post-settlement story of the Second Marsh demonstrates its natural and cultural heritage value to the citizens of Oshawa, who fought for decades to reverse the damage done by industrial and watershed development and to preserve this resource for residents’ education and enjoyment in perpetuity.

Over the last one hundred years, the Second Marsh has suffered repeatedly from human actions designed to exploit, rather than preserve this valuable natural resource. The original bay was much deeper, but in the 1800s, land clearing upstream and the introduction of agriculture to the area caused an increase in erosion along the creek banks which added significant sediment to the bay and shoreline, eventually resulting in the barrier beach. More adjacent construction (CNR, Highway 401, Colonel Sam Drive) and the regular dumping of dredgeate into the Marsh contributed to further sedimentation and habitat loss.

In addition, from 1952 to 1971, effluent from the Harmony Creek Water Treatment Plant was directed into the Marsh.

Meanwhile, however, environmentalists and sportsmen were working to address these concerns and to prove the value of the Marsh. From 1956 till 1973 the Oshawa Fish and Wildlife Advisory Committee (OFWAC), led by Ed Kroll, was banding waterfowl, mainly ducks, in large numbers. Bird banding is a valuable management tool, and by the late

Second Marsh Research Report

1960s, the Marsh banding program was ranked second largest in Ontario and fifth on the entire Atlantic Flyway, banding over 32,600 birds in that 16-year period.

In the mid-1960s, the Oshawa Harbour Commission (OHC) announced their plans to dredge the Marsh to create a deep-water port, and in 1970, despite the objections of the OFWAC, the City transferred 90 hectares of wetland to the Commission for one dollar. The naturalists and sportsmen who had been fighting to preserve the Marsh responded by forming the Second Marsh Defense Association (SMDA). As a result of their efforts, Environment Canada undertook extensive studies of the Marsh ecosystem, health, and wildlife, producing the 1983 *Oshawa Second Marsh Baseline Study*. This study confirmed unequivocally the value of the Marsh and necessity of restoring and preserving it.

In the 1970s, after the City of Oshawa deeded the Marsh over to the Oshawa Harbour Commission, the Commission negotiated with the (then) Ontario Ministry of Natural Resources and arranged to have “water lots” in Lake Ontario opposite Second Marsh deeded to the City with the intention of creating a harbour there. Now that there is no longer a need for another harbour that would include these lots, it is our opinion that they should be returned to the Ministry.

Today, responsibility for the “care and feeding” of the Marsh is undertaken by the Second Marsh Management Committee, which includes the following groups: Friends of Second Marsh (education, interpretation, and stewardship), the City of Oshawa (maintenance through the Parks Department), Ducks Unlimited Canada (restoration management), and the Central Lake Ontario Conservation Authority (C.L.O.C.A.) (environmental monitoring).

7.0 Significant Studies and Plans

Over the last several decades, the natural and cultural heritage value of the Second Marsh has been repeatedly affirmed by a series of important studies and plans, including the three described here.

7.1 *Oshawa Second Marsh Baseline Study, Cecile, 1983*

As it states in the *Biological and Social Values* element that forms part of the *Baseline Study*, “one of the best places to see a variety of wildlife is in a marsh....Second Marsh, a scarce natural area in an expanding urban environment, will increase in value as a quiet place for use by people in passive recreational pursuits such as nature study, photography, and hiking...It should remain as a nearby place for people to keep in touch with nature.”

The Study itself states:

Second Marsh Research Report

Marshes provide both ecological and economic values to people and the natural environment. Second Marsh offers resting and feeding areas for migrating ducks and breeding areas for many species of fish and wildlife. It contains habitats for endangered and rare species. The marsh can act as a filter, trapping sediments and pollutants from the water passing through it. Second Marsh could provide an opportunity for people to see and enjoy wildlife while learning about the marsh ecosystem. Because of its close proximity to Oshawa and the Toronto Central Region, it is readily accessible to many people. (p. xv)

This key study established the importance of the Marsh and formed the basis for a preliminary remediation plan. This became the 1992 *Second Marsh Management Plan*, which was funded by \$1.3 million from Environment Canada.

Patricia Lowe, who was deeply involved in restoring the Marsh and is now Director of Community Engagement at the Central Lake Ontario Conservation Authority (CLOCA) said of the 1983 baseline survey, “I think the key to referencing this document is the importance of scientific evidence in documenting environmental change. This document has been relevant for almost 40 years as a baseline on which to compare existing conditions.”

7.2 *Second Marsh Management Plan (1992) and Draft Oshawa Second Marsh Background Report (2018)*

In 1991, a Steering Committee produced the first two-phase Management Plan for the rehabilitation of the Marsh, adopted by Council in 1992, in response to the following goals:

That the Oshawa Second Marsh be managed for perpetuity as a viable marsh environment in a manner which would enhance the flora and fauna of the marsh ecosystem.

In concert with the primary goal to preserve the natural habitat, other important values of the marsh, such as water quality, fisheries, waterfowl management, scientific interest, passive recreational needs, nature interpretation, and tourism will be considered to optimize the benefits of the marsh to the public. These uses should be considered to the extent that there is no net degradation of the Second Marsh.

In 2000, the “Oshawa Second Marsh: Achieving Phase II of the Management Plan” report led to the decision to build a dike to reroute Harmony Creek to bypass the Marsh and to install a fish barrier gate to prevent invasive carp from entering and damaging the Marsh while permitting native species to enter. A pump was also constructed to permit regular “draw-downs” of the Marsh water level that were meant to promote the

Second Marsh Research Report

regeneration of vegetation.

In their 2018 *Management Plan Background Report*, Schollen and Company state, “Given the significant changes that have occurred at the marsh as a result of restoration activities and emerging invasive species (e.g., Emerald Ash Borer), the Second Marsh Management Committee...recommended that an updated Second Marsh Management Plan be completed.”

This report is now underway. In a September 23 e-mail with Mark Schollen, he provided the following update:

“The process of updating the Management Plan is on-hold due to the COVID situation. We will finalize this plan once the City restarts the process. We have another round of public consultation in our project process. This will entail releasing the final draft of the Management Plan for public review and comment. I expect that it will be early 2021 before we are directed to move forward.”

It is important to note that the actual boundary of the Marsh *includes the area north of Colonel Sam Drive, between the road and the rail line*, as shown in p. 4, Figure 2 of the 1992 *Management Plan* (see Figure 4). The 1992 Management Plan specifies the following: “The City-owned lands north of Colonel Sam Drive and south of the railways are considered to be a part of the total Second Marsh area.” Although Colonel Sam Drive bisects the Marsh, the portion to the north plays an equally important role and should be included as part of the designation, and the legal description altered as required to include all of lots 3 and 4 north of the road to the railway.

If this land were to be developed, it would severely and negatively impact the Marsh. In addition, it serves as an important wildlife corridor, connecting the Marsh to Harmony Creek and Farewell Creek. Without that connection, much of the biological diversity would be lost.

7.3 Draft 2011 Oshawa Waterfront Master Plan

In the *Waterfront Master Plan* by Brook McIlroy Inc. drafted in 2011, seven properties were identified as significant under the heading “Heritage Buildings / Parks,” including the Second Marsh. The Plan emphasized that all of Oshawa’s waterfront properties and features “*function together* as a suite of natural- and cultural-heritage resources that can significantly contribute to a future vibrant, accessible, and sustainable waterfront in Oshawa.”

Second Marsh Research Report

Under “Key Issues,” the Plan states: “Conserve sites of cultural heritage and archaeological significance.” (p. 9), and in section 4.6, “Second Marsh and McLaughlin Bay Wildlife Reserve,” the Plan states the following:

The [1992] Second Marsh Management Plan [see below] remains valid and the pursuit of its objectives is ongoing. Elements of the plan include:

1. Rehabilitation of the marsh as an initial priority and then further development of recreational and educational facilities and amenities;
2. Enhancement of public access and giving identity to the marsh through: name recognition; physical public access; signage; trails; viewing areas; toilets; education and interpretive facility; and parking;
3. Rerouting of Farewell Creek to the original Lake Ontario outlet (completed by Ducks Unlimited Canada).

In 4.6.3, the “Issues and Constraints” section, it lists the following objective: “It would be beneficial to have a long-term agreement in place to ensure that this area remains as a private wildlife reserve open to the public.”

The 2011 Waterfront Plan also recommends that the city undertake archaeological assessments as required and preserve archaeological resources.

8.0 Second Marsh Defence Association (SMDA) and Friends of Second Marsh (FSM)

Oshawa’s First and Second Marsh area has long been the focus of controversy. For the Friends of Second Marsh, a registered charity, the decades-long and bitter battle over the future and survival of the Second Marsh was launched in the mid-to-late 1960s after plans by the Harbour Commission, City of Oshawa, and Federal Government to dredge the Second Marsh to create a deep-water harbour were made public.

In response, in 1966, naturalist Jim Richards, Bob Mills (President Oshawa & District Sportsmen), George Scott (Oshawa Naturalist Club), and waterfowl bander Ed Kroll, as well as other Oshawa environmentalists, joined together to form the Second Marsh Defense Association (SMDA). That same year, Oshawa City Council transferred ownership of the Marsh to the Oshawa Harbour Commission, but it was agreed that ownership would revert to the city if expansion plans were not realized. The SMDA legally incorporated in 1974, and by 1976, the group had gained the support of 11 other groups, including the Federation of Ontario Naturalists (FON), and had built a membership of over 500 supporters from the Oshawa area. Mr. Richards managed to convince Environment Canada to commission a comprehensive study of the

Second Marsh Research Report

environmental richness, sensitivity, and value of the Marsh. The resulting 1983 *Baseline Study* by the Canadian Wildlife Service proved this value, and challenged the idea that it was economically advantageous to create a harbour there as planned.

Other economic changes in the shipping industry combined with ongoing pressure from the SMDA and Oshawa's citizens led to the land being declared "surplus" by the Federal Department of Transport in 1983, triggering the reversion clause, at which point the future looked friendlier and the SMDA changed their name to Friends of Second Marsh and concentrated on raising the funds to restore the Marsh.

An unexpected new partner entered the fray in 1986, when General Motors Canada became interested in building their new administrative offices beside the Marsh. Initially Mr. Richards, (Executive Director, Friends of Second Marsh 1970–1998) was unconvinced, having already discouraged a cement plant, steel smelter, and fertilizer plant from buying, but with guidelines now in place to ensure minimal environmental impact, including a design to accommodate migratory birds and the promise of 51% of the property being maintained as open space, he agreed. So began a fruitful partnership, as Mr. Richards was appointed Manager of the McLaughlin Bay Wildlife Reserve by GMC to create, manage, and develop the area. Mr. Richards cites the "visionary" leadership of former GMC President, the late George A. Peapples.

Ownership of the Marsh officially reverted to the city in November, 1992. However, extensive damage had been done by Harbour Commission interventions by this time, breaching the barrier beach to create an eastern outlet for the purpose of silting up the Marsh. The result was a catastrophic die-off of Marsh vegetation and colonization of the Marsh by invasive species, particularly the devastating common carp.

All of this damage was addressed by the 1992 *Second Marsh Management Plan*, endorsed by Council in February, 1993, the first restoration phase of which was funded in part by \$1.3 million from Environment Canada. The Friends of Second Marsh managed to raise an additional \$1 million to support the work through the dogged determination of core members Jim Richards, Dennis Barry, and Bob Mills, who spoke to every group, club, and media outlet they could find.

In her article "Victory at Second Marsh," writer Margaret Carney interviewed Environment Canada wetlands biologist and former member of the Federation of Ontario Naturalists (FON) Nancy Patterson, who pointed out the significance of the Friends' victory:

"Oshawa Second Marsh may very well have changed the face of community-based advocacy that emerged in the early eighties," says Nancy Patterson. Helping other groups prepare to take action on local environmental issues when she worked for the FON, Patterson continually cited SMDA as a model. "It has always been for me

Second Marsh Research Report

the example to use in talking of commitment and game plan."

The story of the ongoing efforts of many citizen-volunteers, environmentalists, and members of Council to restore and preserve the Marsh demonstrates how the people of Oshawa have endeavoured over a lengthy time period to protect and preserve the area, and is an important story in the history and cultural heritage of the city. In addition, the sustained effort and willingness of the leaders and volunteers of Friends of Second Marsh in guarding it, supported by many hundreds of citizens of Oshawa, is part of the associative value of the Marsh.

9.0 Evaluation of the Site Against Ontario Regulation 9/06

Ontario Regulation 9/06 under the *Ontario Heritage Act* sets out the criteria for determining cultural heritage value or interest, which is required in order to designate a property under the provisions of Part IV of the *Act*.

A property may be designated under Section 29 of the *Act* if it meets one or more of the following criteria for determining whether it is of cultural heritage value or interest.

1. The property has design value or physical value because it:
 - i. is a rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type, expression, material or construction method;
 - ii. displays a high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit; or,
 - iii. demonstrates a high degree of technical or scientific achievement.

2. The property has historical value or associative value because it:
 - i. has direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, organization or institution that is significant to a community;
 - ii. yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an understanding of a community or culture; or,
 - iii. demonstrates or reflects the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder, designer or theorist who is significant to a community.

3. The property has contextual value because it:
 - i. is important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of an area;
 - ii. is physically, functionally, visually or historically linked to its surroundings; or,
 - iii. is a landmark.

We have evaluated the Second Marsh against these criteria and have concluded as follows:

1. The first criterion is not applicable, as there are few man-made structures on the site. These structures consist of the pumphouse on the southwest side, the earthen

Second Marsh Research Report

dike running parallel to the Harmony Creek on the west side of the Marsh, a fish passage structure and various trails, boardwalks, viewing platforms and wildlife habitat structures. None of these, as valuable as they are to the function of the Marsh, would be regarded as having any particular design or physical significance.

2. The property has considerable historical and associative value, for a number of reasons. Prior to European settlement, it was the seasonal home to Indigenous people for many thousands of years. It was mapped by the 17th-century explorer and cartographer Samuel de Champlain during an expedition through the Great Lakes in 1616 as a promising site for a trading post. Subsequently, it actually became the site of a French trading post (located on the high point of the drumlin adjacent to the Marsh) that later provided temporary shelter for one of Oshawa's first European settlers, Captain Benjamin Wilson. The site saw military activity during the War of 1812 when an American gunship fired on the settlement along the shoreline. In 1816, the Harbour Cemetery was established on top of Gifford Hill, later to be relocated to Lakeview Park as the Pioneer Cemetery. Soon afterwards, industry came to the area in 1820 when the Farewell Brothers started a shipbuilding venture on the shore of the bay.
3. The property has contextual value, because it is important in defining and maintaining the character of the northern shore of Lake Ontario, being one of only two marshes existing within the City of Oshawa boundary. As noted previously it is one of the best remaining examples of coastal wetlands in Southern Ontario, resulting in its designation as both a P.S.W. and an A.N.S.I. As a landmark, the Second Marsh is physically, functionally, visually and historically linked to its surroundings.

10.0 Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest

10.1 Description of Property

Oshawa Second Marsh is a 137-ha coastal wetland located along the north shore of Lake Ontario east of the Oshawa Harbour. The Marsh and its surrounding lands include a wide variety of habitat types (e.g. meadow marsh, treed swamp, thicket swamp, open water marsh and ponds) that form a complex biological and hydrological system for a diversity of species. As one of the best remaining examples of coastal wetlands in Southern Ontario, Second Marsh has been designated as a Provincially Significant Wetland (P.S.W.) and provincially significant Life Science Area of Natural and Scientific Interest (A.N.S.I.).

Second Marsh Research Report

10.2 Statement of Cultural Heritage Value

Oshawa's Second Marsh is a site rich in Indigenous and settler history that witnessed the development of the city. It is significant for its direct association with the early history of Oshawa, having been explored and mapped by Samuel de Champlain in 1616 and being the site of an early French trading post and the residence of one of Oshawa's first European settlers. As early as 1816 it provided the setting for the City's first cemetery and a few years later it was the location of a shipbuilding business operated by the Farewell Brothers. It is also significant for its association with several important early Oshawa families, including the Wilsons, the Farewells, the Conants, the Woons, and the Beatons of Beaton's Dairy. It was the southerly terminus of the ancient Scugog Carrying Place Trail and is bordered by the historic Gifford Hill drumlin—the archaeologically significant location of the Wilson homestead and Pioneer Cemetery.

Since the late 1900s, the Marsh has been the focus of intense interest on the part of Environment Canada, local naturalist groups, the Central Lake Ontario Conservation Authority, Ducks Unlimited and the City of Oshawa for its natural heritage significance. Considerable sums of money have been expended in sustaining and improving its biological functions through maintaining the barrier beach and enhancing its vegetation communities. Free, year-round public access to the area has been facilitated by the construction of a network of trails surrounding the Marsh, along with raised viewing decks, osprey nesting platforms and other birdhouses, provided by Friends of Second Marsh and partners.

The Second Marsh is home to a number of rare and at-risk species and provides spawning habitat for several fish species and nesting areas for many birds, including the rare Little Gull. It is a focus of environmental education for Oshawa's children, offering many year-round environmentally-focused programs. It is a good example of an effective pond stormwater- and invasive species-management system. The Marsh tells the story of environmental restoration, featuring tree-planting by Scouts Canada and General Motors employees.

The Marsh is adjacent to several important historic, natural, and recreational areas, including the McLaughlin Bay Wildlife Reserve, Darlington Provincial Park, Scugog Carrying Place Trail, Great Lakes Waterfront Trail, Joseph Kolodzie Oshawa Creek Bike Path, historic Gifford Hill, Lakeview Park, Ed Broadbent Park and the Oshawa Harbour.

In addition to providing recreation to humans, the Marsh and waterfront areas provide refuge and a stopover for migratory birds as well as a pathway for wildlife travelling along the lakeshore.

10.3 Description of Heritage Attributes

The cultural heritage attributes of Oshawa Second Marsh include:

Second Marsh Research Report

- The association of the Marsh and its adjacent landscape with many of Oshawa's founding families and their commercial endeavours, including the Wilsons, the Farewells, the Conants, the Woons, the Beatons, and the Giffords;
- The proximity of the Marsh to several identified archaeological sites, including site #AIGq-46, which is listed in the Ontario Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Sport's provincial archeological registry;
- The value of the Marsh to the many volunteers and citizens of Oshawa who have worked over several decades to support, restore, and maintain the health of this natural resource for the benefit, enjoyment, and recreation of their fellow residents and visitors;
- The many distinct layers of history, including that of First Nations peoples, associated with the Marsh and the adjacent Scugog Carrying Place, and extending through Oshawa's early settlement and industry, up to its current role as a focus for environmental education;
- The barrier beach and view of the harbour, Gifford Hill, Lakeview Park, and Bonnie Brae Point;
- The extent of the natural vegetation (to date, 588 species of plants have been identified at the Marsh - 8 provincially significant and 136 regionally extirpated, rare and uncommon);
- The high diversity of wildlife, including 288 species of birds (the wetland is located on the Atlantic flyway, and therefore is an important staging and nesting area for waterfowl), along with 32 mammal species and numerous fish species;
- The numerous and varied trails and habitats, including meadow, pond, swamp, woodland, marsh and beach;
- The west-side berm and fish-gate structure that separate Harmony Creek and the harbour from the Marsh, protecting it from sediment, contamination, and invasive species;
- The links to other natural coastal features, including Darlington Provincial Park and McLaughlin Bay Wildlife Reserve;
- The network of City-maintained trails, boardwalks and viewing platforms within the Marsh.

11.0 Potential to Designate the Second Marsh as a Cultural Heritage Landscape

Although Report DS-20-31 addressed the question of whether a cultural heritage landscape study should be prepared as a prelude to Lakeview Park and the Second Marsh being designated as Cultural Heritage Landscapes (under either Part IV or Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act*), this approach was not selected, as City Council favoured

Second Marsh Research Report

individual property designation under Part IV.

However, the findings of this report demonstrate that the Second Marsh meets the criteria of a Cultural Heritage Landscape as described in the Provincial Policy Statement (P.P.S), which provides comprehensive province-wide rules for land-use planning in Ontario, covering policies around managing growth, using and managing natural resources, protecting the environment, and public health and safety.

The P.P.S. (2020) defines a *Cultural Heritage Landscape* as:

A defined geographical area that may have been modified by human activity and is identified as having cultural heritage value or interest by a community, including an Indigenous community. The area may include features such as buildings, structures, spaces, views, archaeological sites or natural elements that are valued together for their interrelationship, meaning or association. *Cultural heritage landscapes* may be properties that have been determined to have cultural heritage value or interest under the *Ontario Heritage Act*, or have been included on federal and/or international registers, and/or protected through official plan, zoning by-law, or other land use planning mechanisms.

Natural heritage resources have also been identified and defined by international bodies. A UNESCO World Heritage Site is one that meets one or more of ten criteria established in the World Heritage Convention Operational Guidelines (2005), including the following criteria for natural “properties”:

- To be outstanding examples representing significant on-going ecological and biological processes.
- To contain the most important and significant natural habitats.

While these are “universal” criteria, they demonstrate a global focus on significant natural areas of “intangible” heritage value. In some cases, a site qualifies as a “cultural landscape”; a place that combines natural heritage and cultural heritage features as described in the P.P.S. Such landscapes represent the layering over time of various human activities in an area, and the interrelationship of these activities and the natural elements.

Oshawa’s Second Marsh is an excellent example of this layering, from the earliest Indigenous peoples establishing the Scugog Carrying Place Trail as an access route to the interior and later a key trading route with Europeans, to Oshawa’s first industries, including the ships that were built in the Marsh, and the farms that surrounded it, to its degradation and the die-off of much of its vegetation; and finally to the lengthy struggle of Oshawa’s citizens to restore and preserve it for the future.

Therefore, it would be appropriate in my view to suggest that like Lakeview Park, the Second Marsh does in fact meet the criteria for designating it as an associative Cultural

Second Marsh Research Report

Heritage Landscape, for the following reasons:

- (a) It has heritage significance as a site, over the history and development of the City of Oshawa, associated with early Indigenous and settler activity and trade, and later industrial development, and representative of the interrelationship of these activities and the natural elements; and,
- (b) It is a significant natural habitat that represents on-going ecological and biological processes; and,
- (c) It has strong associative value as a natural-heritage resource that is valued by and has galvanized hundreds of citizen-volunteers in their efforts to restore and preserve it for future residents.

Being mindful of the fact that Council has chosen to designate the Second Marsh as a property of cultural heritage value and significance under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* rather than undertake a Cultural Heritage Landscape Study, the preparation of such a study has not been included as a recommendation under Section 13 of this report.

However, on the basis of the rationale provided above, it is my opinion that in the event Council should decide to revisit this matter at some time in the future, it would be appropriate to undertake a Cultural Heritage Landscape Study for the Second Marsh as described in Section 5.5.1 of Report DS-20-31, dated January 29, 2020.

12.0 McLaughlin Bay Wildlife Reserve

The McLaughlin Bay Wildlife Reserve is located south of the GM Canada headquarters building, along the Lake Ontario Shoreline east of Second Marsh. East of the McLaughlin Bay Wildlife Reserve is Darlington Provincial Park. In combination with the Second Marsh, these natural areas provide an important corridor for wildlife movement along the lakefront to the east.

The Reserve is open to the public for the enjoyment of wildlife habitat and day use activities. Cross-country skiing, snowshoeing and skating are favourite pastimes during the winter, while cycling, walking or hiking, birdwatching, and photography are more popular during the warmer months. One of the goals of the McLaughlin Bay Wildlife Reserve Master Plan was to create an area where people and wildlife could co-exist in harmony.

The Reserve occupies lots 1 and 2, whereas the Oshawa Second Marsh takes in part of lot 2, as well as all of lots 3 and 4 in the Broken Front Concession. From a management perspective, we understand that all City-owned lands north of Colonel Samuel Drive up to the railway in part of lot 2, and all of lots 3 and 4, have generally been included in the area defined as Second Marsh. On the other hand, the map contained in the Terms of

Second Marsh Research Report

Reference for this study does not include these lands within the “area of property to be designated”. This apparent discrepancy is addressed in recommendation no. 2 at the end of this report.

In May 2018, General Motors of Canada, which maintains the Reserve, announced its plan to transfer the area to the city. Discussions are evidently ongoing.

13.0 Recommendations

Based on the findings of this report, we would offer the following recommendations:

1. That Oshawa Second Marsh be designated under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* for its cultural heritage value and interest as detailed in section 10.3.
2. That consideration be given to extending the area to be designated eastward to include the McLaughlin Bay Wildlife Reserve, and, per the 1992 *Management Plan*, northward to include the remaining marshlands located between Colonel Sam Drive and the CN railway line, as shown in Figure 4.
3. That the original plan for the establishment of a Great Lakes Wetland Interpretive Centre (to be located on the two vacant lots immediately northwest of the GM Canada west parking lot) be revived and City Council express its continued support of the venture.
4. That a Cultural Heritage Landscape Study (CHL) be undertaken for the property, should Council decide to revisit this option at some time in the future.
5. That Council consider requesting that the Hamilton-Oshawa Port Authority return the water lots fronting the Second Marsh, which were deeded to them in the 1970s in order to accommodate a then-planned expansion to the Oshawa Harbour, back to the Ministry of Natural Resources and Forestry as additional protection to Oshawa Second Marsh against further intrusion.

Respectfully submitted,

Robert A. Martindale, MCIP, RPP, CAHP

October 2020