

March 9th, 2020

TO: Laura Moebs, Principal Planner, City of Oshawa
FROM: James Neilson and Katherine Hull, ASI
RE: Integrated Columbus Part II Planning Act and Municipal Class Environmental Assessment Act Study - 121 Columbus Road West, City of Oshawa

ASI File: 18CH-056

This memorandum is with regards to the property at 121 Columbus Road West in the City of Oshawa, which was identified as a potential cultural heritage resource as part of the Cultural Heritage Resource Assessment (CHRA) for the Integrated Columbus Part II Planning Act and Municipal Class Environmental Assessment Act Study (prepared by ASI, dated January 2019).

One of the purposes of the CHRA was to identify existing and potential cultural heritage resources as a means of informing the greater Planning Act and Environmental Assessment Act Study. As part of this process, a high-level scan of historical mapping was undertaken to identify the location of early buildings in the study area. In addition, a field review from the public right-of-way was later conducted in November 2018 to confirm the presence of existing and potential cultural heritage resources. Through this process, 121 Columbus Road West (CHR19) was identified as a potential cultural heritage resource. However, according to comments from Heritage Oshawa, the building on the property is not the same building identified in 1877, and in fact, despite its “Gothic Revival” architecture, the building was constructed in 1994. This memorandum is intended to address the comments made by Heritage Oshawa in their review of the report and to confirm their findings about the property.

The following documents are attached to this memorandum:

- Attachment A – Photo of 121 Columbus Road West
- Attachment B – 1988 aerial photo of 121 Columbus Road West
- Attachment C – 2019 aerial photo of 121 Columbus Road West

Outline of New Findings

In January 2020, Heritage Oshawa alerted City of Oshawa staff that they had determined that 121 Columbus Road West was built in 1994 and as such, should not have been identified as a potential cultural heritage resource in the CHRA. The inclusion of this property in the CHRA was based on two key indicators: the presence of a building on or near the site of the existing building on a map from 1877; and a field review from the public right-of-way which showed the presence of a “Gothic Revival” style residential building with a brick

exterior, gable roof with centre gable, and gothic arched windows. This architectural style would have been common in 1877, and as such, it was determined that the residence merited identification as a potential cultural heritage resource.

However, as seen in Attachments B and C, an aerial photograph from 1988 confirms that the building did not exist prior to 1988. Heritage Oshawa was also able to confirm a 1994 construction date. It appears that the property was built to mimic a nineteenth-century heritage Gothic Revival farmhouse and was done so in a convincing fashion from the public right-of-way. Based on this information, we agree with Heritage Oshawa's assessment of the property and that the property should not be considered a potential cultural heritage resource.

Finally, it should be noted that the intention of identifying potential cultural heritage resources as part of the CHRA was not to definitively state that these properties contain cultural heritage value, but rather to identify properties that should be studied and evaluated in the future to determine if they merit heritage recognition. Generally, due to the number of properties involved, the scope of a CHRA does not allow for the focused research and on-site evaluation of individual properties that may reveal additional information about their merits as cultural heritage resources. As the area evolves as a result of the Integrated Columbus Part II Planning Act and Municipal Class Environmental Assessment Act Study, it is generally expected that research and evaluations will be conducted on other properties identified as potential cultural heritage resources in the report and these properties may be found to not meet the criteria for designation under Ontario Regulation 9/06 for any number of reasons.

Conclusion

Based on the findings outlined in this memorandum, the property at 121 Columbus Road West should not be considered a potential cultural heritage resource. As such, there are now a total of 61 recognized and potential cultural heritage resources within the study area of the Integrated Columbus Part II Planning Act and Municipal Class Environmental Assessment Act Study, of which 29 have been identified as potential cultural heritage resources.

Please note that the map of existing and potential cultural heritage resources contained in Appendix A of the report has not been updated to reflect this change, but is amended to delete the subject property.



Attachment A – November 2018 photo of 121 Columbus Road West



Attachment B – 1988 Aerial Photo of 121 Columbus Road West



Attachment C – 2019 Aerial Photo of 121 Columbus Road West

