

Evaluation of 760 King Street West - Union Cemetery According to *Ontario Regulation 9/06* City of Oshawa

Prepared for Harrison Whilsmith Planner A **City of Oshawa** 50 Centre Street South Oshawa, ON L1H 3Z7 Tel: (905) 436-3311 ext.2697 Email: HWhilsmith@oshawa.ca

By

Archaeological Research Associates Ltd.

205 Cannon Street East Hamilton, ON L8L 2A9 Tel: (519) 804-2291 Fax: (519) 286-0493 www.araheritage.ca

> HR- 464-2023 Project #: 2023-0211

> September 19 2023

205 Cannon Street East, Hamilton, ON L8L 2A9 Tel: (519) 804-2291 Fax: (519) 286-0493 araheritage.ca

TABLE OF CONTENTS

TABLI	E OF CONTENTS	I					
1.0	INTRODUCTION	1					
2.0	METHOD	1					
2.1	Field Survey	1					
2.2	Research	1					
2.3	Consultation	1					
2.4	Method Conclusion	1					
3.0	PROPERTY INFORMATION	1					
4.0	LEGISLATIVE FRAMEWORK	3					
4.1	Federal Legislation	3					
4.2	Provincial Policies and Guidelines	3					
4.	2.1 The Planning Act	3					
	2.2 The Provincial Policy Statement (2020)	4					
	2.3 Ontario Heritage Act	5					
5.0	BACKGROUND INFORMATION	6					
5.1	Architecture or Design	6					
5.2	History	9					
	2.1 Oshawa Community Development	9					
	2.2 Site Specific History:	10					
6.0	EVALUATION OF SIGNIFICANCE	16					
7.0	HERITAGE ATTRIBUTES	17					
8.0	STATEMENT OF CULTURAL HERITAGE VALUE OR INTEREST	18					
9.0	MAP OF HERITAGE ATTRIBUTES	21					
10.0	CONCLUSIONS	23					
11.0	BIBLIOGRAPHY AND SOURCES 24						

LIST OF MAPS

Map 1: Subject Property in the City of Oshawa	2
Map 2: Map of Heritage Attributes of 760 King Street West	22
Map 3: Photo Locations at 760 King Street, Union Cemetery	27
Map 4: Subject Property shown on an 1861 Historic Map	45
Map 5: Subject Property shown on an 1878 Historic Map	46
Map 6: Subject Property shown on an Historic 1914 Topographic Map	47
Map 7: Subject Property shown on an Aerial Image from 1954	48
Map 8: Subject Property on Current Aerial Image	49

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1: Map of Union Cemetery Layout	41
Figure 2: Rev. Robert Thornton, c. 1870	42

Figure 3: Newspaper Advertisement for Union Cemetery, 1868	42
Figure 4: Union Cemetery Entrance, 1927	43
Figure 5: Grounds of Union Cemetery, 1927	43
Figure 6: Union Cemetery Mausoleum, c. 1928	44

LIST OF IMAGES

Image 1: Main Entrance of 760 King Street West	28
Image 2: Office Building West of Front Entrance at 760 King Street West	28
Image 3: Graveyard East of Front Entrance at 760 King Street West	29
Image 4: Facade of Mausoleum North of Front Entrance at 760 King Street West	29
Image 5: East Elevation of Mausoleum at 760 King Street West	30
Image 6: West Elevation of Mausoleum at 760 King Street West	30
Image 7: Example of Early Log Style Monument East of Front Entrance at 760 King	
Street West	31
Image 8: Example of Obelisk Monument at 760 King Street West	31
Image 9: Example of Faux Stone Column Topped with Urn and Drapery at 760 King	
Street West	32
Image 10: View of Mausoleum along Southern Boundary at 760 King Street West	32
Image 11: View from Southeast Corner at 760 King Street West	33
Image 12: Example of Modern Granite Monument at 760 King Street West	33
Image 13: View from Eastern Boundary at 760 King Street West	34
Image 14: Example of Mature Vegetation at 760 King Street West	34
Image 15: Example of Columnar Pedestal at 760 King Street West	35
Image 16: Example of "Finger Pointing Up" Motif on Tombstone at 760 King Street	
West	35
Image 17: Detail of Tombstone with "Lamb" Motif at 760 King Street West	36
Image 18: Military Cenotaph at 760 King Street West	36
Image 19: Pathway along East Boundary at 760 King Street West	37
Image 20: View from Northeast Corner at 760 King Street West	37
Image 21: Detail of Cemetery Boundary at 760 King Street West	38
Image 22: View of Central Pathway Leading South at 760 King Street West	38
Image 23: View of Western Boundary along Thornton Road at 760 King Street West	39
Image 24: Example of Columbaria at 760 King Street	39
Image 25: View of West Boundary at 760 King Street West	40
Image 26: View of Southwestern Corner at 760 King Street West	40

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1: Summary of Property Ownership at 760 King Street West	14
Table 2: Evaluation of the Cultural Heritage Value or Interest of 760 King Street	
West in Accordance with O. Reg. 9/06	16
Table 3: Relationship of Heritage Attributes to Cultural Heritage Values	17

LIST OF APPENDICES

Appendix A: Photographs Appendix B: Historic Photos Appendix C: Historic Maps

GLOSSARY OF ABBREVIATIONS

ARA – Archaeological Research Associates Ltd.
CHVI – Cultural Heritage Value or Interest
MCM – Ministry of Citizenship and Multiculturalism
OHA – Ontario Heritage Act
O. Reg. – Ontario Regulation

PERSONNEL

Principal: P.J. Racher, MA, CAHP Heritage Operation Manager: K. Jonas Galvin, MA, RPP, MCIP, CAHP Project Manager: J. McDermid, BA, CAHP Field Survey: A. Savov, BA, Dip. Heritage Conservation, R. Hendricks, MA Historical Research: R. Hendricks Photography: A. Savov, R Hendricks Cartographer: M. Johnson (GIS) Technical Writers: A. Savov Editor: A. Barnes MA CAHP

HERITAGE RESEARCH REPORT REQUIREMENTS

City of Oshawa Requirements	Relevant ARA Section
1. Title Page (including date of report)	Cover Page
2. Table of Contents	Page i
3. Introduction including the purpose of the report and any legislative context	1.0 Introduction 4.0 Legislative Framework
4. A description of the Subject Property (legal description and any defining characteristics, including buildings, landscapes and structures)	3.0 Property Information 5.0 Background Information 7.0 Heritage Attributes
5. A map depicting the site location within the City	3.0 Property Information (Map 1)
6. The historical and cultural significance of the Subject Property	5.0 Background Information Appendix B Appendix C
7. Evaluation of the Subject Property against Ontario Regulation 9/06	6.0 Evaluation of Significance
8. A statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest	8.0 Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest
9. A list of the heritage attributes, with a description of each attribute	 7.0 Heritage Attributes 8.0 Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest 9.0. Map of Heritage Attributes
10. A final recommendation on designation	10. Conclusions
11. An Appendix containing labeled colour photographs of the site	Appendix A

27

41

45

1.0 INTRODUCTION

The City of Oshawa has requested that Archaeological Research Associates Ltd. (ARA) evaluate the cultural heritage value or interest (CHVI) of 760 King Street West, also known as Union Cemetery, in the City of Oshawa according to *Ontario Regulation 9/06* as amended by *Ontario Regulation 569/22* (*O. Reg*) to determine if the property is worthy of designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (*OHA*).

2.0 METHOD

This report examines the design of the property, presents its history and describes its context.

2.1 Field Survey

A field survey was conducted on June 13, 2023. The property was viewed and photographed in its entirety as Permission to Enter was granted by the City of Oshawa.

2.2 Research

Background information was obtained from historical maps (i.e., illustrated atlases), archival sources (i.e., historical publications and records) and published secondary sources (online and print). No previous research reports were provided by the City of Oshawa.

2.3 Consultation

The City of Oshawa commissioned ARA to prepare a Heritage Research Report for Union Cemetery, municipally known as 760 King Street West (subject property). The City of Oshawa identified the subject property as a priority for designation as a result of changes to the *OHA* brought on by Bill 23. Specifically, this work addresses the deadline for all listed properties to be designated or removed from the Heritage Register within two years (January 1, 2025). No additional consultation was undertaken for this report.

2.4 Method Conclusion

Using the results of the field survey and research detailed above, the CHVI of 760 King Street West, Union Cemetery, is evaluated against the criteria prescribed in *O. Reg. 9/06* of the *OHA*. If the property meets two or more of the criteria, a Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest is then provided including a list of heritage attributes.

3.0 PROPERTY INFORMATION

Civic Address: 760 King Street West, City of Oshawa, ON. Common Name: Oshawa Union Cemetery Legal Description: LOTS 6 & 7, PART LOTS 415 SHEET 16C PLAN 370 EAST WHITBY, S/T EASEMENT OVER PART LOT 4 SHEET 16C PLAN 370

The location of the property is displayed in Map 1.

The southeast corner of the property appears to be a newer section of the cemetery (part of Section A on Figure 1) and contains a few modern burials with what appear to be plots open for internments. This section, while part of the active cemetery, is located beyond the boundary examined for designation in this report.



Map 1: Subject Property in the City of Oshawa (Produced by ARA under licence using ArcGIS® software by Esri, © Esri)

4.0 LEGISLATIVE FRAMEWORK

4.1 Federal Legislation

At the national level, *The Standards and Guidelines for Conservation of Historic Places in Canada* (Parks Canada 2010) provides guidance for the preservation, rehabilitation, and restoration of historic places, including cultural heritage landscapes (CHLs) and built heritage resources (BHRs). Such guidance includes the planning and implementation of heritage conservation activities.

With respect to CHLs, the *Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places* define them as "any geographical area that has been modified, influenced or given special cultural meaning by people, and that has been formally recognized for its heritage value" (Parks Canada 2010:113). The *Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places* identifies the three categories of cultural landscapes which are also contained within the UNESCO (2010) Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention: designed; organically evolved (vernacular); and associative. The Ministry of Heritage, Sport, Tourism and Culture Industries (MCM) *Information Sheet #2 Cultural Heritage Landscapes* (2006c:1-2) continues these definitions:

- **Designed Cultural Landscapes** These are areas that are clearly defined and created intentionally by human design. They may include garden and parkland landscapes constructed for aesthetic reasons and may be associated with religious or monumental buildings.
- Evolved Cultural Landscapes This type of landscape is often the result of a social, economic, administrative and/or religious motivation that has continued to develop into its present form due to associations with, or in response to, its natural environment. There are two sub-categories of this CHL type:
 - Relic Landscape One in which an evolutionary process came to an end but its significant distinguishing features are still visible.
 - Continuing Landscape One that retains associations with traditional practices but which retains an active social role in the current community while continuing to evolve and exhibit material evidence of this ongoing evolution.
- **Associative Cultural Landscapes –** These landscapes have religious, artistic, or cultural associations with nature rather than with material cultural evidence, which may be insignificant or absent.

The *Standards and Guidelines* further outlines specific guidelines for cultural heritage landscapes, including 11 subsections on: "evidence of land use; evidence of traditional practices; land patterns; spatial organization; visual relationships; circulation; ecological features; vegetation; landforms; water features; and built features" (Parks Canada 2010:50).

4.2 **Provincial Policies and Guidelines**

4.2.1 The Planning Act

In Ontario, the *Planning Act* is the primary document used by provincial and municipal governments in land use planning decisions. The purpose of the *Planning Act* is outlined in Section 1.1 of the Act, which states:

1.1 The purposes of this Act are,

(a) to promote sustainable economic development in a healthy natural environment within the policy and by the means provided under this Act;

(b) to provide for a land use planning system led by provincial policy;

(c) to integrate matters of provincial interest in provincial and municipal planning decisions;

(d) to provide for planning processes that are fair by making them open, accessible, timely and efficient;

(e) to encourage co-operation and co-ordination among various interests;

(f) to recognize the decision-making authority and accountability of municipal councils in planning.1994, c. 23, s. 4.

Part I Provincial Administration, Section 2 states:

The Minister, the council of a municipality, a local board, a planning board and the Municipal Board, in carrying out their responsibilities under the Act, shall have regard to, among other matters, matters of provincial interest such as,

(d) the conservation of features of significant architectural, cultural, historical, archaeological, or scientific interest. 1990: Part I (2. d).

Part I Provincial Administration, Section 3, 5 Policy statements and provincial plans states:

A decision of the council of a municipality, a local board, a planning board, a minister of the Crown and a ministry, board, commission or agency of the government, including the Tribunal, in respect of the exercise of any authority that affects a planning matter,

(a) shall be consistent with the policy statements issued under subsection (1) that are in effect on the date of the decision; and

(b) shall conform with the provincial plans that are in effect on that date, or shall not conflict with them, as the case may be. 2006, c. 23, s. 5; 2017, c. 23, Sched. 5, s. 80.

The current *Provincial Policy Statement (PPS*), issued under section 3 of the *Planning Ac*t, came into effect May 1st, 2020.

4.2.2 The Provincial Policy Statement (2020)

The *Provincial Policy Statement (PPS 2020)* contains a combined statement of the Province's land use planning policies. It provides the provincial government's policies on a range of land use planning issues including cultural heritage outlined in Section 1.7 c) as including:

Ontario's long-term prosperity, environmental health, and social well-being depend on conserving biodiversity, protecting the health of the Great Lakes, and protecting natural heritage, water, agricultural, mineral and cultural heritage and archaeological resources for their economic, environmental and social benefits (Section 1.7 e) MMAH 2020:24).

The *PPS* 2020 promotes the conservation of cultural heritage resources through detailed polices in Section 2.6, such as 2.6.1 Significant built heritage resources and significant cultural heritage landscapes shall be conserved" and

2.6.3 Planning authorities shall not permit development and site alteration on adjacent lands to protected heritage property except where the proposed development and site alteration has been evaluated and it has been demonstrated that the heritage attributes of the protected heritage property will be conserved (MMAH 2020:31).

4.2.3 Ontario Heritage Act

The OHA, R.S.O. 1990, c.018 is the guiding piece of provincial legislation for the conservation of significant cultural heritage resources in Ontario. The OHA gives provincial and municipal governments the authority and power to conserve Ontario's heritage. The OHA has policies which address individual properties (Part IV) and heritage districts (Part IV), which require municipalities to keep a register of such properties and allows the municipalities to list non-designated properties which may have cultural heritage value or interest (Section 27).

In order to objectively identify cultural heritage resources, O. Reg. 9/06 (as amended by O. Reg, 569/22) made under the *OHA* sets out nine criteria for determining cultural heritage value or interest (CHVI) (MCM 2006b:20–27). The criteria set out in the regulation were developed to identify and evaluate properties for designation under the *OHA*. Best practices in evaluating properties that are not yet protected employ O. Reg. 9/06 (as amended by O. Reg, 569/22) to determine if they have CHVI. These nine criteria are:

- 1. The property has design value or physical value because it is a rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type, expression, material or construction method,
- 2. The property has design value or physical value because it displays a high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit, or
- 3. The property has design value or physical value because it demonstrates a high degree of technical or scientific achievement.
- 4. The property has historical value or associative value because it has direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, organization or institution that is significant to a community,
- 5. The property has historical value or associative value because it yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an understanding of a community or culture, or
- 6. The property has historical value or associative value because it, demonstrates or reflects the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder, designer or theorist who is significant to a community.
- 7. The property has contextual value because it is important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of an area,
- 8. The property has contextual value because it is physically, functionally, visually or historically linked to its surroundings, or
- 9. The property has contextual value because it is a landmark. (O. Reg. 569/22, s. 1 (2)).

The OHA provides three key tools for the conservation of built heritage resources (BHRs) and cultural heritage landscapes (CHLs). It allows for protection as:

1. A single property (i.e., farmstead, park, garden, estate, cemetery), a municipality can designate BHRs and CHLs as individual properties under Part IV of the *OHA*.

- 2. Multiple properties or a specific grouping of properties may be considered a CHL, as such, a municipality can designate the area as a Heritage Conservation District (HCD) under Part V of the *OHA*.
- 3. Lastly, a municipality has the authority to add an individual or grouping of non-OHA designated property(ies) (often called "listed" properties) of heritage value or interest on their Municipal Heritage Register.

5.0 BACKGROUND INFORMATION

5.1 Architecture or Design

Union Cemetery was first established as a 19-acre cemetery which included the portions of land associated with 'Thorntons Burying Ground'. The Thorntons Burying Ground area of the cemetery contains the resting places for several pioneer families and early settlers.

Pioneer cemeteries serve to maintain a link with Ontario's past – a link through which we may glean information about individuals, families and communities. These quiet and reflective spaces, along with the monuments and vegetation they contain, hold stories about our history. Each pioneer cemetery is unique and will tell different tales of past lifeways.

Ontario cemeteries are a tangible link to ordinary individuals as well as famous people in our past. Many are an irreplaceable part of the province's cultural heritage. Their cultural heritage landscape, monuments and vegetation are part of our built environment, with their own unique history, development, and growth. Older cemeteries are a tangible link to ordinary individuals as well as famous people in our past. The inscriptions on their monuments instruct us about local, medical, and material history, cultural geography, historical archaeology, folklore, genealogy, and much more (Government of Ontario 2022).

Most pioneer cemeteries in Ontario share some characteristics. Pioneers tended to select natural settings as a preferred space to lay their dead as they were thought to attract and comfort the bereft.

Cemeteries often started as family burial plots on private land, mostly as a matter of convenience and a means by which the living may be close to the loved ones they have lost. Early burial grounds were sometimes donated or deeded to churches or communities to be used as community cemeteries. Pioneer cemeteries are typically not designed landscapes, meaning that assigned burial plots did not usually exist. This haphazard method of burial resulted in a distinct distribution of graves. Instead of the typical rows of burials found in planned cemeteries, pioneer cemeteries exhibit clustered burials. Most pioneer cemeteries did not include formal landscaping, such as curated vegetation or designed paths. However, some pioneer-era cemeteries had fencing or a natural wooded area/agricultural land separation to mark the division between the sacred and profane.

In the late 1860s Union cemetery expanded east and north. The new cemetery design reflected elements of the picturesque movement and followed a more rural cemetery design, also known as Garden design. This style of cemetery design

...often include traditional burial gardens with in-ground memorials and upright granite monuments, tranquil cremation gardens and walkways, above-ground columbarium niches for cremated human remains, mausoleums, crypts, and

personalized memorial features such as benches, trees, and landscape elements. The properties are typically landscaped with an abundance of trees, gardens and ponds, all of which contribute to the natural setting of the cemetery (Larkin 2011:23,24).

In contrast to the original 19 acres, the new area of the cemetery was designed to include meandering roads and pathways, trees and natural landscaping elements, and designated areas for burial areas. The expansion of the cemetery was completed by H.A. Engelhart who designed several Picturesque cemeteries in Ontario, most notably, Toronto's Mount Pleasant Cemetery in 1874.

Throughout Union Cemetery the Victorian influence can be seen. Victorian era gravestones commonly include images and symbols that are derived from worldly items, using everyday body parts, gestures and objects to convey grief and meaning (Heritage Manitoba n.d.:20). In general, these symbols can be divided into two groups, those associated with the human body and those with worldly objects and features. Natural symbolism is also common. Plants and trees, especially flowers, have been included on gravestones due to their beauty that can take a myriad of forms. They are also ephemeral; they live briefly before fading but also hold the potential for renewal in their annual cycle of death and birth. As such, they have been adopted as a symbol representing the cycle of human life and death (Heritage Manitoba n.d.:23). In the 19th century, Ontario produced a number of limestones that were used for memorial slabs and monuments. As such, limestone, in addition to marble, were the most popular types of stones for the earliest grave markers in Ontario (Anson-Cartwright 2003:5). When distinguishing between these stone types, limestone gravestones are usually grey or darker while marble is lighter or whiter (Anson-Cartwright 2003:5).

Union Cemetery displays the evolution of cemetery design from the informal original 19-acre pioneer cemetery to the designed expansion which included more formal burial plot design nestled amongst natural and built features (See Figure 1). This is evident in the Map of Oshawa's Union Cemetery provided by the Oshawa Library where two unique sectors of the subject property are colour coded representing a difference in typology and temporal elements. The green portion represents the southern sector of the cemetery which terminates onto King Street West and includes the earliest layer of the cemetery known as "Thornton's Burying Ground" as well as a transitory section connecting the south and northern portions. This pioneer portion of the cemetery is generally unorganized and follows meandering pathways with sporadic vegetation and a pattern of familial clusters and individual burials many of which include influential Oshawa residents, the earliest burial dating to as early as 1837.

The sector marked yellow on the map represents a subsequent layer comprised of two separate donations that increased the cemetery size to its current 32 acres. It extends to the north boundary of the cemetery in proximity to Adelaide Avenue. It differs from the pioneer section of the cemetery in organization, as it follows a rigid orthogonal pattern, and includes recent burials characterized by modern granite headstones, neatly organized large burial plots, and landscape features such as pathways and mature vegetation.

A description of the architecture/design of 760 King Street West is as follows:

- 32-acre rectangular plot with several built features (Figure 1):
 - Office building by the entrance of the cemetery (Image 2)
 - One-and-a-half storey rectangular brick structure with gable roof, parapet and stone detailing

- Exhibits features associated with ecclesial architecture such as gothic windows and cross details
- Limestone mausoleum located at the center of the circular pathways (Image 4)
 One-storey rectangular structure
- Columbaria (Image 24)
 - Four columbaria within Center Sections, two situated near the mausoleum in Southern Section
 - Rectangular stone structures with classical treatments such as pediment, engaged columns and architrave
 - Columbaria are situated in a landscaped environment including commemorative benches and garden beds
- Meandering paved pathways
- Orthogonal plan with a visual and stylistic differences throughout the site
- For the purposes of this report Oshawa Union Cemetery is best described as being divided into three sections: Southwest section (Thorntons Burying Ground, the Original Cemetery), Center section and Northern section.
- The Southwest Section includes the original Thorntons Burying Ground Pioneer Cemetery
 - Includes the original Presbyterian burial ground situated along Thronton Road North and extending to King Street West in the south (Figure 1)
 - Section is rectangular in nature and internally bounded by pathways.
 - Burial plots which do not follow a rigid/grid layout and/or rhythmic spacing (Image 11)
 - Evidence of familial clusters and monuments (Image 8)
 - Primarily older burials, earliest known being the burial of Alexander Armstrong in 1837
 - Mix of Stone grave markers including limestone, sandstone and granite headstones (Image 7,Image 9)
 - Variety of different tombstone styles including: "Finger pointing up, Lamb, Log, Cross and Dove" motifs (Image 7, Image 16)
 - Some evidence of hand carved epitaphs and decorative motifs on monuments (Image 16)
- The Center section follows a layout consistent with that of the "Memorial Park" type cemetery with typical features such as: in-ground and upright monuments, meandering pathways, burial gardens and landscape elements, it occupies the southern and central portion of the cemetery.
 - Center section displays a fusion between the northern and southwest sectors with some neatly organized burial plots mixed in with sporadically placed burials around and in between them.
 - WWI Soldiers Plot, Mausoleum, Office Building, Columbaria, the McLauglin Family Vault
 - Stone and metal grave markers including limestone, sandstone and granite headstones (Image 7,Image 9)
 - Variety of different tombstone styles including: "Finger pointing up, Lamb, Log, Cross and Dove" motifs (Image 7, Image 16)
 - Some evidence of hand carved epitaphs and decorative motifs on monuments (Image 16)
 - Winding and circular pathways with intermittent mature vegetation and shrubs (Figure 1)
 - Modest changes in topography with generally flat areas with small rolling topography.

- Meandering asphalt pathways
- Includes part of the WWII Soldiers Plot
 - In ground monuments neatly organized in rows and laid out in accordance to particular conflicts
- Six columbaria
- Masonic monument
- Muted evidence of roadbed of an electric service railroad that passed through the landscape prior to the cemetery.
- It was in part designed by Canadian landscape architect H.A. Engelhardt.
- North section follows the layout of a modern cemetery with evidence of orthogonal planning as suggested by its neat rectangular rows each accompanied by a pathway and surrounded by mature vegetation.
 - Individual cemetery plots are organized in rows
 - Smaller monuments with less ornate motifs
 - Motifs common in the north section include; various cross designs, flowers and letters
 - Granite tombstones with machine or laser cut epitaphs
 - Military cenotaph
 - Neatly organized in ground burials in rows following a layout representative of the different conflicts of participation
 - Large stone cross statue with a list of conflicts associated with fallen soldiers
 - Artillery piece along pathways
 - Canadian flag on a pole, further commemorating the service of fallen soldiers
- Given the evolution over time in both an organic manner (southwest section) and a designed manner (centre and north sections) the cemetery can be considered an evolved cultural heritage landscape

5.2 History

5.2.1 Oshawa Community Development

Oshawa's first Euro-Canadian resident was Benjamin Wilson, who settled with his family on the shore of Lake Ontario, near the mouth of Oshawa Creek (Kaiser 1921). Wilson was a native of Vermont and used an old French trading post located along the lakeshore as his family's first shelter. Wilson's daughter Nancy was the first settler infant born in Ontario County; she would later marry into the Pickell family, who were another early settler family (Kaiser 1921). In 1842, the hamlet of Oshawa consisted of little more than a few houses, two hotels, and three general stores, although a post office was established later that year. Edward Skea was the owner of the largest general store, which had been in operation since 1835. The settlement was initially called "Skea's Corner," but was changed to "Oshawa" at the suggestion of Moody Farewell, a resident of the nearby hamlet of Harmony (Kaiser 1921).

Oshawa incorporated as a village in 1849 (City of Oshawa 2023). The Grand Trunk Railway was constructed through the area in 1856; prior to this, Port Sydenham (now Oshawa Harbour) was the most important way of transporting goods to the fledgling settlement. The Grand Trunk Railway had a station in Oshawa, and there were several other forms of transportation such as a daily stage and mail coach that ran as far north as Beaverton, located on Lake Simcoe. By 1857, Oshawa had several large factories, including the Oshawa Manufacturing Company (which

livery stable, several general stores, hotels taverns, and other businesses. The settlement's population was approximately 3,000 (Lovell 1857). Tremaine's 1860 Map of the County of Ontario. Upper Canada indicates the area around what would become Union Cemetery is largely rural in nature although it was located within proximity of the Village of Oshawa (see Map 4). There are several historically surveyed roads which appear to be laid on a grid pattern between lots and concessions.

In 1876, Col. Robert S. McLaughlin moved to Oshawa and established a carriage manufacturing factory known as the McLaughlin Carriage Company. At one point, this was the largest carriage works in the British empire (City of Oshawa 2023). In the early 1900s, McLaughlin took advantage of the automobile's developing popularity and contracted with Buick Motor Company in order to use the Buick-developed engine in a McLaughlin automobile. Production began in 1907 (City of Oshawa 2023). In 1915, McLaughlin began producing Chevrolets, and three years later a merger between McLaughlin Motor Company and Chevrolet created General Motors Canada, which is still a major employer within the city (City of Oshawa 2023).

An 1877 map of Ontario County produced by J.H. Beers & Company indicates that while the area surrounding the cemetery has largely remained rural, the Town of Oshawa had grown substantially (Map 5). The cemetery is still located in proximity to a number of historical thoroughfares between concession blocks, and there appears to be a great number of structures located on individual lots. Oshawa incorporated as a city in 1924 (City of Oshawa 2023). A 1930 topographic map shows that the City of Oshawa had grown substantially since 1877 (Map 6). Subdivisions and residential surveys are beginning to proliferate to the west of Oshawa's core settlement, and numerous buildings have been constructed along major thoroughfares.

A 1954 aerial photograph appears similar to the 1930 topographic map (Map 7). While the area around the cemetery appears to be predominately rural/agricultural in nature, subdivisions can be seen at the edge of the photograph near Stevenson Road North. A modern aerial photograph demonstrates how the limits of the city have expanded. Subdivisions now almost surround the subject property and numerous side streets have been surveyed off of the historically existing roads between concession blocks (see Map 5). The City of Oshawa continues to be a major industrial and manufacturing hub as it remains through most of the late nineteenth and all of the twentieth century, with over 3,000 people employed in those trades (City of Oshawa 2023).

5.2.2 Site Specific History:

- Crown Patent for Lot 16, Concession 2 (200 acres) went to King's College on July 3, 1828 (see Table 1).
- The settlement's first brick Presbyterian church, known as St. Andrew's, was established • in 1837 as well, with Reverend Robert Thornton as its first minister on land belonging to Robert & Euphemia Spears (City of Oshawa 2023).
 - The first Presbyterian meeting place in Whitby Township was a wood structure 0 shared with an Anabaptist congregation established around 1825 near what is now the corner of Garrard Road and Highway 2 (Dundas Street East) but was destroyed by a storm in 1855 (Whitby Archives 1959, Oshawa Museum 2011, Terech 2016). Four years after Thornton's arrival, the new church was constructed. It could house approximately 600 parishioners and had a 19-acre burial ground (Terech 2016). According to historic atlases, the church was located at the intersection of Thornton Road and King Street West, or slightly to the north of the

intersection along Thornton Road. No images or sketches of the 1837 church were discovered, nor was the date of the church's demolition found in any historical records.

- The earliest recorded burial in what would become the Oshawa Union Cemetery was in 1837 with the burial of Alexander Armstrong (Oshawa Museum 2023).
- On July 22, 1845, King's College sold the south 50 acres of Lot 16, Concession 2 to Robert M. Spears.
 - A month later, on August 25, a note was made in the land registry regarding "Evidence Respecting the Original Monument." The reason for this notation was not explained (LRO #40).
- On September 13, 1848, Robert M. Spears sold 11 acres of Lot 16, Concession 2 to Adam Spears & Trustees, although the organization the Trustees belonged to was not named.
 - These were likely the Trustees of St. Andrew's Presbyterian Church. Robert and Euphemia Spears sold this small portion of their acreage to St. Andrew's for the construction of a brick church and establishment of a 19-acre burial ground at the northeast corner of Thornton Road and King Street West. It was known locally as "Thornton's Burying Ground" (City of Oshawa 2022).
- In November 1848, Robert M. Spears officially sold 9 acres to Robert N. Thornton. even though St. Andrew's Presbyterian Church had been occupying the property since 1837 when it was founded by Reverend Robert N. Thornton. The discrepancy between the land records and other historical sources regarding the founding of St. Andrew's Church has not been explained.
 - Robert N. Thornton was born near Edinburgh, Scotland in April 1806 and married Margaret Thompson on April 16, 1833, before the couple immigrated to New York together. After arriving in New York, the couple continued towards Toronto, but instead disembarked near Coburg (Terech 2016, Figure 2).
 - While en route to Toronto, Thornton found a small settlement of predominately Scottish immigrants in Whitby and remained to be their minister. Thornton also administered several other Presbyterian congregations and served parishioners from Whitby to Port Hope (Kaiser 1921).
 - Thornton was a fierce advocate of the Temperance movement and was also heavily involved in the education system of the fledgeling settlement. He served as the local Superintendent of Education from 1853 to 1861 (Kaiser 1921, Terech 2016).
 - Robert Thornton died on February 11, 1874, at the age of 69. He is buried in Oshawa Union Cemetery along with many members of his family (Terech 2016).
- The 1861 *Tremaine's Map of the County of Ontario, Upper Canada* by G.C. Tremaine indicates that the subject property was located at the northeast corner of an intersection of two historic roadways (see Map 4). The property is located between three lots, the easternmost belonged to James Fewster, the middle belonged to a family called Hyland, and the westernmost lot belonged to R.H.T., or Robert Thornton. There is a structure and a church indicated on Thornton's lot, the denomination of which was not labelled but was likely the Presbyterian church and cemetery founded by Rev. Thornton in 1837. There are no structures marked on the Hyland and Fewster lots.
- By the late 1860s, both local usage and advertising meant that the existing boundaries of "Thornton's Burying Ground" were no longer sufficient, and the cemetery needed to be expanded (Oshawa Museum 2023, Figure 3).
 - As a result of the need to acquire more land for the expansion of Oshawa's Presbyterian cemetery, the Oshawa Union Cemetery Company was founded in

1875 for the purpose of purchasing surrounding lots from their owners to increase the burial ground's acreage (Oshawa Museum 2023).

- The cemetery's name was changed to "Oshawa Union," as it served residents of both Oshawa and Whitby (Flaherty 2021).
- This portion of the cemetery (Centre Section) was designed by H.A. Engelhardt, a pioneer of Canadian landscape architecture (Oshawa Museum 2023).
 - Henry Adolph (H.A.) Engelhardt was born Johann Heinrich Engelhardt in Prussia in 1830. He trained as a civil engineer and immigrated to the United States in 1851 at the age of 21. After some time spent in the United States, he moved to Canada in 1870 (CLF 2023).
 - In 1871, Engelhardt designed the Ontario Institution for the Education of the Deaf and Dumb (now Sir James Whitney School for the Deaf), located in Belleville, and also planned the grounds for Brantford's Ontario Institution for the Education of the Blind (now the W. Ross Macdonald School) (CLF 2023).
 - He was also responsible for the design of several cemeteries in Ontario which conformed to the qualities of the Picturesque movement, including Belleville Cemetery (1873), Port Hope's Union Cemetery (1874), and Mount Pleasant in Toronto (1874).
 - Engelhardt also served as the superintendent of the Mount Pleasant Cemetery from 1875 to 1888 in order to oversee the work (CLF 2023).
 - Engelhardt believed that cemeteries should be full of open space that conforms to the natural features of a site, which was in contrast to the British practices of the day, which included fenced plots that "marred its harmonious appearance" (CLF 2023).
 - Engelhardt also published an influential book on landscape gardening/architecture in Canada, entitled *The Beauties of Nature Combined with Art* (CLF 2023).
 - Englehardt died in 1897 (CLF 2023).
- The 1877 map of Whitby East Township in J.H. Beers & Co.'s *Illustrated Historical Atlas* of the County of Ontario, Ontario" indicates that the parcels that once comprised part of the subject property seen in the 1861 map had been consolidated into the Oshawa Union Cemetery, which is clearly labelled on the 1877 atlas (Map 5). There was a structure located north of southwest corner of the property (the original 19-acre church lot), but whether it was the old brick Presbyterian church or the other structure on Robert Thornton's former lot which also appears in 1861 is unknown.
- On November 19, 1919, The Trustees of the Oshawa Presbyterian Chapel granted approximately 4 acres in the southwest part of Lot 16, Concession 2 to the Ontario Union Cemetery Company.
- On July 6, 1922, the Ontario Union Cemetery Company transferred their holdings to the Corporation of the City of Oshawa. The exact size of the parcel was not noted in the land records.
 - According to the Oshawa Museum, the consolidation was made possible due to local businessman and philanthropist George W. McLaughlin, who acquired approximately 30 acres of the Oshawa Union Cemetery by 1922, as well as the deeds to the original Presbyterian cemetery (Flaherty 2021, Oshawa Museum 2023).
 - The final size of the Oshawa Union Cemetery had expanded from the original 19 acres to 32 acres,

- Many of Oshawa's influential citizens were buried there, including: the McLaughlin family, John Schofield of The Schofield Works, James Robson, the founder of Robson's Tannery, and artists Florence Helena McGillivray and Alexandra Luke (see Figure 4 and Figure 5).
- The cemetery's mausoleum was built in 1926, and office was added in 1934 (Oshawa Museum 2023, see Figure 6).
- A topographic map from 1930 indicates the subject property continued to be used as a cemetery and that the configuration of the historically surveyed roads had not changed. However, a roadbed or railway intersects the cemetery property towards its north boundary (Map 6). This is likely an Electric Railway, which granted land to the City of Oshawa in 1929. There is a structure within the boundaries of the cemetery, although its location does not correspond to the previous structure which was located towards the west side of the property, near Thornton Road. The 1930 building is likely the mausoleum, which was constructed in 1926.
- Municipal Plan 370 was registered on January 17, 1941.
- On March 19, 1951, the property was annexed to the City of Oshawa from the Township of East Whitby.
- A 1954 aerial photograph of the subject property shows that the cemetery was already well established, with landscaping and monuments largely concentrated in the south twothirds of the property (Southwest and Centre Sections), which fronted onto King Street East (Map 7). The footprint of the former electric railway or roadbed is still apparent on the landscape but had been lined with trees within the boundaries of the subject property. While the resolution of the photograph is poor, it also appears that the cemetery had numerous landscaped paths and roadways which meander throughout the property.
- The City of Oshawa is the current owner of Union Cemetery, located at 760 King Street West.

(LRO #40)						
Instrument #	Instrument Date		Grantor	Grantee	Comments	
	Patent	3 Jul 1828	The Crown	King's College	All 200 acres Lot 16 Con 2	
25377	B&S	22 Jul 1845	King's College	Robert M. Spears	S 50 acres Lot 16 Con 2	
27632		25 Aug 1845	Evidence Respecting Original Monument	Evidence Respecting Original Monument		
54521	B&S	13 Sep 1848	Robert M. Spears	Adam Spears & Trustees	11 acres Lot 16 Con 2	
34951	B&S	3 Nov 1848	Robert M. Spears	Robert H. Thornton	9 acres	
48711	B&S	4 Apr 1853	Robert M. Spears	Barnabas Cook	30 acres	
379	B&S	9 Jan 1854	Adam Spears	A. Burnett & G. Burns, Trustees	1⁄4 acres	
2796	B&S	1 Dec 1854	Barnabas Cook	William Smith	30 acres	
6546	B&S	1 Nov 1856	Major & Elizabeth Harper	Isaac French	39 acres Lot 16 Con 2	
6755	B&S	2 Mar 1848 [reg. 1856]	King's College	Major Harper	Centre 100 acres Lot 16 Con 2	
33778	B&S	9 Apr 1857 [reg. 1864]	William Smith	James Fewster	30 acres	
934	B&S	10 Apr 1873	James Fewster	William Thomas	Part S ¼	
1140	B&S	17 Jun 1873	Robert H. Thornton	William Thomas	Part S ¼	
2479	B&S	27 Apr 1875	William Thomas	Union Cemetery Co.	Part S ¼	
9369	Grant	19 Nov 1919	Trustees of the Oshawa Presbyterian Chapel	Ontario Union Cemetery Co.	W 3.88 acres of SW 10.66	
10249	Transfer	6 Jul 1922	Ontario Union Cemetery Co.	Corp. Town of Oshawa	Parts Lot 16, Concession 2	
12181	Grant	3 Jan 1928	Franklin French & wife	Alfred Edward Fisher	39 acres Lot 16 Concession 2	
13386	Grant	22 Nov 1929	Canadian National Electric	Corp. City of Oshawa	1.28 acres of W	
370	Plan	17 Jan 1941	First Addition to Municipal Plan (357)		S ¼ & N ½ of S ½	
221	Grant	17 May 1949	Alfred Edward Fisher	Milton D. Brown	All Lot 7	
23531	By-Law	17 Aug 1950	Township of East Whitby		By-Law 1462	
23915	Grant	5 Dec 195	Milton D. Brown	Alfred H. & Leon N. Robinson	All Lot 7	
63891	Order	9 Nov 1950	Corp. City of Oshawa		Annexing Lot to City of Oshawa	
64253	By-Law	19 Mar 1951	Corp. City of Oshawa		By-Law 2854 annexing lots in City of Oshawa	
72359	Grant	9 Jan 1952	Alfred H. & Leon N. Robinson	Corp. City of Oshawa	All Lot 7 as in 23915	
87043	Agreement	30 May 1956	Corp. City of Oshawa	Principal Investments Ltd	All Lot 7	
140141	Grant	23 Jul 1964	Corp. City of Oshawa	Principal Investments Ltd	All Lot 7 as in 87043	
140142	Grant	23 Jul 1964	Principal Investments Ltd, John C. Newland	Runnymede Development Corp.	All Lot 7 as in 140141	
	Plan				Part Lat 15 Parts	

Corp. City of Oshawa

Table 1: Summary of Property Ownership at 760 King Street West
(LRO #40)

40R-2343

Plan

Reference

30 May 1975

Part Lot 15, Parts

26 to 42 included

--

Instrument #	Instrument	Date Grantor		Grantee	Comments
40R-5485	Plan Reference	21 Nov 1979	Corp. City of Oshawa		
D238775	Transfer	6 Jan 1987	Runnymede Development Corp.	Corp. City of Oshawa	All Lot 7
40R-11534	Plan Reference	1 Sep 1988	Corp. City of Oshawa		Part Lot 15 Parts 3-12 Expropriation of Part Lot 7 Part of Part 12, Part Lot 4
40R-24720	Plan Reference	29 Jan 2007	Corp. City of Oshawa		

5.3 Context

- Due to the 32 acres size, Union Cemetery occupies a large area with a wide frontage onto King Street West and Thornton Road North.
- Bounded by Thornton Road North to the west, King Street West to the south and Goodman Creek to the east.
- South boundary of the cemetery terminates onto King Street West
 - King Street West is a 5-lane major arterial road which generally runs in a eastwest direction through Oshawa.
- The north boundary of 760 King Street West backs onto a subdivision which includes detached, single family, residential buildings.
- The surrounding community encompasses commercial spaces, subdivision lots and parks such as McLaughlin Park
 - McLaughlin Park shares a connection to the subject property as it contains the remains of the McLauglin family including Gorge W. McLaughlin, an important benefactor of the cemetery and prominent citizen of Oshawa.
- East boundary of the subject property is set by Goodman Creek
 - Goodman Creek is managed by the City of Oshawa and located within the parcel of land which runs along the eastern edge of Union Cemetery. The landscape adjacent to union cemetery is naturalized with mature trees and vegetation.
- The cemetery is defined by wrought iron gates with a prominent "Union Cemetery" sign, marking the cemetery's main entrance along King Street West and metal fencing with rows of mature trees along the east, west and north boundaries.
- In proximity to Oshawa's downtown core. Union Cemetery is centrally placed in the urban fabric of Oshawa slightly east of the commercial downtown core.

6.0 EVALUATION OF SIGNIFICANCE

Accordance with O. Reg. 9/06				
Description	Yes/ No	Value		
The property has design value or physical value because it is a rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type, expression, material or construction method	Yes	Union Cemetery has physical value as a representative example of an early pioneer cemetery and a Garden cemetery design. The original pioneer portion includes 19 acres in the southwest corner and holds the memorials for some of the earliest pioneer families. This undesigned section includes memorials often clustered in familiar groups or sporadically placed. The remainder of the cemetery follows the picturesque movement or "Garden design". The Garden designs, as expressed in Union Cemetery, were organized and intentional created calm and reflective spaces integrating burial gardens, in-ground memorials, upright granite monuments, tranquil walkways, columbaria, mausoleums and memorial landscape features such as benches and vegetation.		
		As a whole, Union Cemetery has design of physical value as an evolved cultural heritage landscape which showcase several representative examples of cemetery design spanning well over a century and a half. Union Cemetery contains some well-designed sections of the		
The property has design value or physical value because it displays a high degree of craftsmanship or artistic value		landscape but does not display a high degree of craftsmanship or artistic value. The materials and ornamentation designs are like other evolved cemeteries.		
The property has design value or physical value because it displays a high degree of technical or scientific achievement		Union Cemetery does not display a high degree of technical or scientific achievement.		
The property has historical value or		Union Cemetery reflects the early history of the City of Oshawa and holds the memorials of some of Oshawa's earliest pioneer families, some which date back to 1837.Over the cemetery's 186-year history, it has been the final resting place for some of Oshawa's most prominent families and citizens, such as members of the Conant and Pedlar family, Rev. Robert Thornton, R.S. McLaughlin, artists Florence H, McGillivray and Alexandra Luke, along with many others.		
associative value because it has direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, organization or institution that is significant to a community	Yes	Union Cemetery is directly associated with Rev. Robert Thornton, the first Presbyterian minister for both Oshawa and Whitby and by extension the Presbyterians community as Union Cemetery was the site of the first dedicated Presbyterian church in Whitby. In addition, Union Cemetery is associated with the Oshawa Union Cemetery Company, created in 1875 to consolidate land around the existing cemetery in order expand the cemetery's boundaries. Union Cemetery serves as an expression and example of how local faith based organized in the community came together to ensure a final resting places for its citizens.		
The property has historical value or associative value because it yields or has the potential to yield information that contributes to the understanding of a community or culture	Yes	Union Cemetery contains gravestones which provide information about earlier setters including family genealogical information and serves as a tangible link to understanding the past.		

Table 2: Evaluation of the Cultural Heritage Value or Interest of 760 King Street West in Accordance with O. Reg. 9/06

Description	Yes/ No	Value
The property has historical value or associative value because it demonstrates or reflects the work or ideas of an architect, builder, artist, designer or theorist who is significant to a community	Yes	Union Cemetery reflects the work of Prussian-born landscape architect H.A. Engelhardt, who designed the central section of the cemetery in 1875. Engelhardt was known for expressing the aesthetic associated with the picturesque movement through his cemetery designs and was also responsible for the design of several other cemeteries such as Port Hope's Union Cemetery and Mount Pleasant in Toronto.
The property has contextual value because it is important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of an area	Yes	Union Cemetery is easily distinguishable as a cemetery and important in defining the character of the area. The park like setting, location, size, and street frontage in relation to the encompassing suburban community defines the intersection.
The property has contextual value because it is physically, functionally, visually or historically linked to its surroundings	Yes	Union Cemetery has been functionally and historically linked to the surroundings for over 180 years. Union Cemetery was originally established as the 19-acre churchyard of Oshawa's first Presbyterian church in 1837, it expanded to over 30 acres by the 1920s.
The property has contextual value because it is a landmark	Yes	Union Cemetery is a landmark within the City of Oshawa. It is situated in a prominent location along a major arterial road. It is a well-known marker in the community as it is the largest cemetery in Oshawa and houses the remains of many citizens.

7.0 HERITAGE ATTRIBUTES

An examination of the relationship between the heritage attributes and the cultural heritage value or interest outlined in Table 3 assisted with the development of the list of heritage attributes.

Table 3: Relationship of Heritage Attributes to Cultural Heritage Values

Cultural Heritage Value or Interest	Heritage Attribute
 Union Cemetery has physical value as a representative example of an early pioneer cemetery and a Garden cemetery design. As a whole, Union Cemetery has design of physical value as an evolved cultural heritage landscape which showcase several representative examples of cemetery design spanning well over a century and a half. 	 The monuments and grave markers with their variety of materials, design motifs, surviving inscriptions and placement associated with the original 19-acre portion of the cemetery The presence of the office building, limestone mausoleum, columbaria's, military cenotaph, and various monuments and markers found throughout the entire cemetery The wrought iron gates marking the cemetery's main entrance The metal fencing and row of mature trees which denote the cemetery boundary The designed circulation patterns which create defined spaces of various shapes and sizes The park-like setting, meandering pathways, and designed natural features of the site Unobstructed view of the 32-acre cemetery located at the corner of Thornton Road in the City of Oshawa
Union Cemetery reflects the early history of the City of Oshawa and holds the memorials of some of Oshawa's earliest pioneer families, some which date back to 1837. Union Cemetery has associative value and is directly associated with Rev. Robert Thornton, the Presbyterians community, and Oshawa Union Cemetery Company.	 The monuments and grave markers with their variety of materials, design motifs, surviving inscriptions and placement associated with the original 19-acre portion of the cemetery Unobstructed view of the 32-acre cemetery located at the corner of Thornton Road in the City of Oshawa

Cultural Heritage Value or Interest	Heritage Attribute
Union Cemetery contains gravestones which provide information about earlier setters including family genealogical information and serves as a tangible link to understanding the past.	 Unobstructed view of the 32-acre cemetery located at the corner of Thornton Road in the City of Oshawa The monuments and grave markers with their variety of materials, design motifs, surviving inscriptions and placement associated with the original 19-acre portion of the cemetery
Union Cemetery reflects the work of Prussian-born landscape architect H.A. Engelhardt.	 The designed circulation patterns which create defined spaces of various shapes and sizes The park-like setting, meandering pathways, and designed natural features of the site
Union Cemetery is easily distinguishable as a cemetery and important in defining the character of the area.	 Unobstructed view of the 32-acre cemetery located at the corner of Thornton Road in the City of Oshawa The wrought iron gates marking the cemetery's main entrance The metal fencing and row of mature trees which denote the cemetery boundary
The property has contextual value as it is physically and historically linked to its surroundings. The cemetery has been functionally and historically linked to the surroundings for over 180 years	Unobstructed view of the 32-acre cemetery located at the corner of Thornton Road in the City of Oshawa
760 King Street West is a landmark within the City of Oshawa.	 Unobstructed view of the 32-acre cemetery located at the corner of Thornton Road in the City of Oshawa The wrought iron gates marking the cemetery's main entrance The metal fencing and row of mature trees which denote the cemetery boundary

8.0 STATEMENT OF CULTURAL HERITAGE VALUE OR INTEREST

Introduction and Description of Property

760 King Street West, commonly known as Oshawa Union Cemetery, is located along King Street West and Thornton Road North. The property occupies a 32-acre rectangular plot and has rolling topography.

Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest

Union Cemetery has physical value as a representative example of an early pioneer cemetery and a Garden cemetery design. The original pioneer portion includes 19 acres in the southwest corner and holds the memorials for some of the earliest pioneer families. This undesigned section includes memorials often clustered in familiar groups or sporadically placed. The remainder of the cemetery follows the picturesque movement or "Garden design". The Garden designs, as expressed in Union Cemetery, were organized and intentional created calm and reflective spaces integrating burial gardens, in-ground memorials, upright granite monuments, tranquil walkways, columbaria, mausoleums and memorial landscape features such as benches and vegetation. As a whole, Union Cemetery has design of physical value as an evolved cultural heritage landscape which showcase several representative examples of cemetery design spanning well over a century and a half.

Union Cemetery has historic value as it reflects the early history of the City of Oshawa and holds the memorials of some of Oshawa's earliest pioneer families, some which date back to 1837. Over the cemetery's 186-year history, it has been the final resting place for some of Oshawa's most prominent families and citizens, such as members of the Conant and Pedlar family, Rev. Robert Thornton, R.S. McLaughlin, artists Florence H, McGillivray and Alexandra

Luke, along with many others. Union Cemetery is directly associated with Rev. Robert Thornton, the first Presbyterian minister for both Oshawa and Whitby and by extension the Presbyterians community as Union Cemetery was the site of the first dedicated Presbyterian church in Whitby. In addition, Union Cemetery is associated with the Oshawa Union Cemetery Company, created in 1875 to consolidate land around the existing cemetery in order expand the cemetery's boundaries. Union Cemetery serves as an expression and example of how local faith based organized in the community came together to ensure a final resting places for its citizens.

Union Cemetery has historic or associative value as it contains gravestones which provide information about earlier setters including family genealogical information and serves as a tangible link to understanding the past.

Union Cemetery has associative value as it reflects the work of Prussian-born landscape architect H.A. Engelhardt, who designed the central section of the cemetery in 1875. Engelhardt was known for expressing the aesthetic associated with the picturesque movement through his cemetery designs and was also responsible for the design of several other cemeteries such as Port Hope's Union Cemetery and Mount Pleasant in Toronto.

Union Cemetery has contextual value as it is easily distinguishable as a cemetery and important in defining the character of the area. The park like setting, location, size, and street frontage in relation to the encompassing suburban community defines the intersection.

Union Cemetery has been functionally and historically linked to the surroundings for over 180 years. Union Cemetery was originally established as the 19-acre churchyard of Oshawa's first Presbyterian church in 1837, it expanded to over 30 acres by the 1920s.

Union Cemetery is a landmark within the City of Oshawa. It is situated in a prominent location along a major arterial road. It is a well-known marker in the community as it is the largest cemetery in Oshawa and houses the remains of many citizens.

Cultural Heritage Attributes

Union Cemetery has physical value as a representative example of an early pioneer cemetery and a Garden cemetery design. As a whole, Union Cemetery has design of physical value as an evolved cultural heritage landscape which showcase several representative examples of cemetery design spanning well over a century and a half. The property contains the following heritage attributes that reflect this value:

- The monuments and grave markers with their variety of materials, design motifs, surviving inscriptions and placement associated with the original 19-acre portion of the cemetery
- The presence of the office building, limestone mausoleum, columbaria's, military cenotaph, and various monuments and markers found throughout the entire cemetery
- The wrought iron gates marking the cemetery's main entrance
- The metal fencing and row of mature trees which denote the cemetery boundary
- The designed circulation patterns which create defined spaces of various shapes and sizes
- Unobstructed view of the 32-acre cemetery located at the corner of Thornton Road in the City of Oshawa
- The park-like setting including meandering pathways and designed nature features of the site

Union Cemetery has historic value as it reflects the early history of the City of Oshawa and holds the memorials of some of Oshawa's earliest pioneer families, some which date back to 1837. Over the cemetery's 186-year history, it has been the final resting place for some of Oshawa's most prominent families and citizens, such as members of the Conant and Pedlar family, Rev. Robert Thornton, R.S. McLaughlin, artists Florence H, McGillivray and Alexandra Luke, along with many others. Union Cemetery is directly associated with Rev. Robert Thornton, the first Presbyterian minister for both Oshawa and Whitby and by extension the Presbyterians community as Union Cemetery was the site of the first dedicated Presbyterian church in Whitby. In addition, Union Cemetery is associated with the Oshawa Union Cemetery Company, created in 1875 to consolidate land around the existing cemetery in order expand the cemetery's boundaries. Union Cemetery serves as an expression and example of how local faith based organized in the community came together to ensure a final resting places for its citizens. The property contains the following heritage attributes that reflect this value:

- The monuments and grave markers with their variety of materials, design motifs, surviving inscriptions and placement associated with the original 19-acre portion of the cemetery
- Unobstructed view of the 32-acre cemetery located at the corner of Thornton Road in the City of Oshawa

Union Cemetery contains gravestones which provide information about earlier setters including family genealogical information and serves as a tangible link to understanding the past. The property contains the following heritage attributes that reflect this value:

- Unobstructed view of the 32-acre cemetery located at the corner of Thornton Road in the City of Oshawa
- The monuments and grave markers with their variety of materials, design motifs, surviving inscriptions and placement associated with the original 19-acre portion of the cemetery

Union Cemetery has associative value as it reflects the work of Prussian-born landscape architect H.A. Engelhardt, who designed the central section of the cemetery in 1875. Engelhardt was known for expressing the aesthetic associated with the picturesque movement through his cemetery designs and was also responsible for the design of several other cemeteries such as Port Hope's Union Cemetery and Mount Pleasant in Toronto. The property contains the following heritage attributes that reflect this value:

- The designed circulation patterns which create defined spaces of various shapes and sizes
- The park-like setting including meandering pathways and designed nature features of the site

Union Cemetery has contextual value as it is easily distinguishable as a cemetery and important in defining the character of the area. The park like setting, location, size, and street frontage in relation to the encompassing suburban community defines the intersection. The property contains the following heritage attributes that reflect this value:

- Unobstructed view of the 32-acre cemetery located at the corner of Thornton Road in the City of Oshawa
- The wrought iron gates marking the cemetery's main entrance
- The metal fencing and row of mature trees which denote the cemetery boundary

Union Cemetery has been functionally and historically linked to the surroundings for over **180 years.** Union Cemetery was originally established as the 19-acre churchyard of Oshawa's first Presbyterian church in 1837, it expanded to over 30 acres by the 1920s. The property contains the following heritage attributes that reflect this value:

• Unobstructed view of the 32-acre cemetery located at the corner of Thornton Road in the City of Oshawa

Union Cemetery is a landmark within the City of Oshawa. It is situated in a prominent location along a major arterial road. It is a well-known marker in the community as it is the largest cemetery in Oshawa and houses the remains of many citizens. The property contains the following heritage attributes that reflect this value:

- Unobstructed view of the 32-acre cemetery located at the corner of Thornton Road in the City of Oshawa
- The wrought iron gates marking the cemetery's main entrance
- The metal fencing and row of mature trees which denote the cemetery boundary

9.0 MAP OF HERITAGE ATTRIBUTES

The following figure displays the heritage attributes as outlined in Section 7.0 above.



Map 2: Map of Heritage Attributes of 760 King Street West

O. Reg. 9/06 (as amended by O. Reg. 569/22) of the OHA requires that to be designated, a property must meet two or more of the criteria. 760 King Street West meets seven criteria for determining CHVI as outlined in *O. Reg.9/06.*

The *Provincial Policy Statement* notes that CHVI is bestowed upon cultural heritage resources by communities (MMAH 2020). Accordingly, the system by which heritage is governed in this province places an emphasis on the decision-making of local municipalities in determining CHVI. It is hoped that the information presented in this report will be useful in those deliberations.

11.0 BIBLIOGRAPHY AND SOURCES

Blumenson, J.

1990 *Ontario Architecture. A Guide to Styles and Building Terms 1784 to the present.* Toronto: Fitzhenry and Whiteside.

City of Oshawa

- 2022 Union Cemetery. Accessed online at: <u>https://www.oshawa.ca/en/home-property/union-cemetery.aspx</u>.
- 2023 A Brief History of the City of Oshawa. Accessed online at: https://www.oshawa.ca/en/parks-recreation-and-culture/resources/Documents/A-Brief-History-of-the-City-of-Oshawa.pdf.

Cultural Landscape Foundation (CLF)

2023 *Heinrich Engelhardt*. Accessed online at: <u>https://www.tclf.org/pioneer/heinrich-adolph-engelhardt</u>.

Flaherty, D.

2021 Union Cemetery: Scenes from the past and present. The Oshawa Express: March 11.

Fram, M.

2003 *Well-Preserved The Ontario Heritage Foundation's Manual of Principles and Practice for Architectural Conservation.* Erin: Boston Mills Press.

Government of Ontario

- 2009 Ontario Heritage Act, R.S.O. 1990, c. O.18. Accessed online at: www.elaws.gov.on.ca/html/statutes/english/elaws_statutes_90o18_e.htm.
- 2022 Designated Cemeteries. Accessed online at <u>https://www.ontario.ca/page/designated-cemeteries</u>
- 2022 Ontario Regulation 569/22 made under the Ontario Heritage Act. Accessed online at: <u>https://www.ontario.ca/laws/regulation/r22569</u>

Heritage Resources Centre (HRC), University of Waterloo

2009 Ontario Architectural Style Guide. Accessed online at: <u>https://uwaterloo.ca/heritage-resources-centre/files/uploads/files/heritage_resources_centre_architectural_styles_guide_reduced.pdf</u>.

Kaiser, T.E.

1921 *Historic Sketches of Oshawa*. The Reformer Printing & Publishing Co., Ltd.: Oshawa.

Land Registry Office (LRO) 40

- 2023 Lot 16, Concession 2, East Whitby Township, Ontario County in the *Abstract Index to Deeds*. AO Microfiche, GSU 179168.
- 2023 Lots 4 7 & 15, Sheet 16C, Plan 370 in the Township of East Whitby, Town of Oshawa. Accessed online at: <u>www.ONland.ca</u>.

Lovell, J.

1857 *The Canada Directory for 1857 – 1858.* J. Lovell Publishers: Montreal.

McGill University

2001 *The Canadian County Atlas Digital Project*. Accessed online at: <u>http://digital.library.mcgill.ca/countyatlas/default.htm</u>.

McGill University

2001 The Canadian County Atlas Digital Project. Accessed online at: <u>http://digital.library.mcgill.ca/countyatlas/default.htm</u>.

Ministry of Citizenship and Multiculturalism (MCM)

2006 Ontario Heritage Toolkit: Heritage Property Evaluation.

Ministry of Municipal Affairs and Housing (MMAH)

2020 *Provincial Policy Statement, 2020.* Toronto: Ministry of Municipal Affairs and Housing.

Ministry of Citizenship and Multiculturalism (MCM)

- 2006. Info Sheet #2: Cultural Heritage Landscapes. Ontario Heritage Toolkit Series. Toronto: Ministry of Culture.
- 2010 Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada 2nd Edition. Parks Canada Accessed online at: <u>www.historicplaces.ca/media/18072/81468-parks-s+g-eng-web2.pdf</u>.

Ontario Council of University Libraries (OCUL)

2018 *Historical Topographic Map Digitization Project*. Access online at: <u>https://ocul.on.ca/topomaps/</u>.

Ontario Historical County Maps Project (OHCMP)

2018 Ontario Historical County Maps Project. Accessed online at: http://maps.library.utoronto.ca/hgis/countymaps/maps.html.

Oshawa Museum

- 2011 *Rev. Dr. Robert H. Thornton*. Accessed online at: <u>https://olivefrench.wordpress.com/2011/06/20/rev-dr-robert-h-thornton/</u>.
- 2019 Union Cemetery is a Real Spot of Beauty. Accessed online at: <u>https://oshawamuseum.wordpress.com/2019/05/10/union-cemetery-is-a-real-spot-of-beauty/</u>.
- 2023 Union Cemetery. Accessed online at: <u>http://discoverhistoricoshawa.com/listings/union-</u> cemetery/.

Ontario Council of University Libraries (OCUL)

2018 *Historical Topographic Map Digitization Project*. Access online at: <u>https://ocul.on.ca/topomaps/</u>.

Ontario Historical County Maps Project (OHCMP)

2018 Ontario Historical County Maps Project. Accessed online at: <u>http://maps.library.utoronto.ca/hgis/countymaps/maps.html</u>.

Terech, L.

2016 Oshawa Museum Blog: Where Streets Get Their Names – Thornton Road. Accessed online at: <u>https://oshawamuseum.wordpress.com/tag/robert-thornton/</u>.

University of Toronto 2022 Aerial Image, 1954.

Whitby Public Library Archives

- 1959 *Dr. Robert Thornton Memorial Cairn.* Accessed online at: https://vitacollections.ca/whitbynews/2284048/data.
- 2023 *Rev. Robert Thornton, D.D.* Accessed online at: <u>https://images.ourontario.ca/whitby/details.asp?ID=48599</u>.



Appendix A: Photographs

Map 3: Photo Locations at 760 King Street, Union Cemetery (Produced by ARA under licence using ArcGIS® software by Esri, © Esr



Image 1: Main Entrance of 760 King Street West (Photo taken June 13, 2023; Facing North)



Image 2: Office Building West of Front Entrance at 760 King Street West (Photo taken June 13, 2023; Facing South)



Image 3: Graveyard East of Front Entrance at 760 King Street West (Photo taken June 13, 2023; Facing East)



Image 4: Facade of Mausoleum North of Front Entrance at 760 King Street West (Photo taken on June 13, 2023; Facing North)



Image 5: East Elevation of Mausoleum at 760 King Street West (Photo taken on June 13, 2023; Facing East)



Image 6: West Elevation of Mausoleum at 760 King Street West (Photo taken on June 13, 2023, Facing West)



Image 7: Example of Early Log Style Monument East of Front Entrance at 760 King Street West (Photo taken June 13, 2023; Facing East)



Image 8: Example of Obelisk Monument at 760 King Street West (Photo taken on June 13, 2023; Facing North)



Image 9: Example of Faux Stone Column Topped with Urn and Drapery at 760 King Street West (Photo taken June 13, 2023; Facing East)



Image 10: View of Mausoleum along Southern Boundary at 760 King Street West (Photo taken on June 13, 2023; Facing Northwest)


Image 11: View from Southeast Corner at 760 King Street West (Photo taken on June 13, 2023; Facing Northwest)



Image 12: Example of Modern Granite Monument at 760 King Street West (Photo taken on June 13, 2023; Facing Northeast)



Image 13: View from Eastern Boundary at 760 King Street West (Photo taken on June 13, 2023; Facing West)



Image 14: Example of Mature Vegetation at 760 King Street West (Photo taken on June 13, 2023; Facing Northwest)



Image 15: Example of Columnar Pedestal at 760 King Street West (Photo taken on June 13, 2023; Facing Northeast)



Image 16: Example of "Finger Pointing Up" Motif on Tombstone at 760 King Street West (Photo taken on June 13, 2023; Facing West)



Image 17: Detail of Tombstone with "Lamb" Motif at 760 King Street West (Photo taken on June 13, 2023; Facing Southwest)



Image 18: Military Cenotaph at 760 King Street West (Photo taken on June 13, 2023; Facing West)



Image 19: Pathway along East Boundary at 760 King Street West (Photo taken on June 13, 2023; Facing North)



Image 20: View from Northeast Corner at 760 King Street West (Photo taken on June 13, 2023; Facing Southwest)



Image 21: Detail of Cemetery Boundary at 760 King Street West (Photo taken on June 13, 2023; Facing West)



Image 22: View of Central Pathway Leading South at 760 King Street West (Photo taken on June 13, 2023; Facing South)



Image 23: View of Western Boundary along Thornton Road at 760 King Street West (Photo taken on June 13, 2023; Facing South)



Image 24: Example of Columbaria at 760 King Street (Photo taken on June 13, 2023; Facing East)



Image 25: View of West Boundary at 760 King Street West (Photo taken on June 13, 2023; Facing Northwest)



Image 26: View of Southwestern Corner at 760 King Street West (Photo taken on June 13, 2023; Facing South)



Appendix B: Historic Photos



Figure 2: Rev. Robert Thornton, c. 1870 (Whitby Public Library Archives 2023)

esva.) ear the Residence of Rev. Dr. Thorn ton, Main Road. Sthese grounds are very desirable for location and beaaty, parties wishing to purchase lots are respectfully informed that they may have an opportunity by applying to the undersigned on to the care taker, James Carruthers, on the premises. ALEX. BURNET. 0.1241.0 Chairman of Committee Figure 3: Newspaper Advertisement for Union Cemetery, 1868

(Oshawa Museum 2023)



Figure 4: Union Cemetery Entrance, 1927 (Oshawa Museum 2019)



Figure 5: Grounds of Union Cemetery, 1927 (Oshawa Museum 2019)



Figure 6: Union Cemetery Mausoleum, c. 1928 (Oshawa Museum 2023)



Appendix C: Historic Maps

Map 4: Subject Property shown on an 1861 Historic Map (Produced under licence using ArcGIS® software by Esri, © Esri; OHCMP 2018)



Map 5: Subject Property shown on an 1878 Historic Map Produced under licence using ArcGIS® software by Esri, © Esri; McGill University 2001)



Map 6: Subject Property shown on an Historic 1914 Topographic Map (Produced under licence using ArcGIS® software by Esri, © Esri; OCUL 2021)



Map 7: Subject Property shown on an Aerial Image from 1954 (Produced under licence using ArcGIS® software by Esri, © Esri; University of Toronto 2021)



Map 8: Subject Property on Current Aerial Image Produced under licence using ArcGIS® software by Esri, © Esri; Google Earth 2023)