

To: Community Services Committee

From: Ron Diskey, Commissioner,
Community Services Department

Report Number: CS-18-51

Date of Report: June 15, 2018

Date of Meeting: June 21, 2018

Subject: Public Art Master Plan

File: F-1000

1.0 Purpose

The purpose of this report is to receive approval of the Public Art Master Plan.

Attachment 1 is the Draft Public Art Master Plan with its associated appendices including the Public Art Policy, Public Art Task Force Terms of Reference and Summary of Oshawa Public Art Collection.

2.0 Recommendation

That the Community Services Committee recommend to City Council:

1. That based on report CS-18-51, the Public Art Master Plan be approved; and,
2. That City staff request the funding to support the Public Art Master Plan Funding Model as part of the 2019 budget process.

3.0 Executive Summary

The proposed Public Art Master Plan (PAMP) addresses the strategic direction to “Create Vibrant Places and Spaces” outlined in Culture Counts: Oshawa’s Arts, Culture and Heritage Plan.

The PAMP is an important decision-making tool for the ongoing implementation of the City’s Public Art Program in Oshawa. In order to grow the Public Art collection and care for public artworks, the PAMP acts as a roadmap for Oshawa City Council, City staff, and the community for the next 10 years.

The PAMP is an extension of the Public Art Policy framework and allows the City to strategically consider and incorporate public art projects into city beautification, creative placemaking and community engagement initiatives.

The PAMP allows for the responsible acquisition and maintenance of public art works through a collaborative approach where various City departments work together, via a Public Art Staff Team, and in concert with the Public Art Task Force (PATF) and public at large.

The PAMP recommends a multi-faceted approach to funding future Public Art which includes funds relating to acquiring art as well as funding to support the long-term care and maintenance of Public Art.

The approach to acquiring future Public Art is also linked to current and future planning. Changes in the community, urban development and new practices in public art, may require the PAMP to be amended. As such, the PAMP should be treated as a living document that evolves and adapts after careful consideration when new information and opportunities arise.

Developed in collaboration with the Public Art Task Force, and in consultation with the public, key stakeholders and City staff, the Public Art Masterplan identifies the priority zones, areas and sites for future public artworks.

The distinct zones include:

1. **Zone: Downtown** – the urban core
2. **Zone: Trails and Lakefront** – select natural corridors and waterfront areas
3. **Zone: Corridors** – select suburban (non-downtown urban core) areas
4. **Zone: Gateways into the City** – primary transit and access points
5. **Zone: Legends Harmony North** – our growing community

4.0 Input From Other Sources

The Public Art Master Plan Staff Working Group:

- Recreation and Culture Services
- Parks Services
- Planning Services
- Corporate Communications
- Engineering Services
- Finance Services

The Public Art Task Force consisting of representatives from Durham College (Faculty of Media, Art and Design), the Robert McLaughlin Gallery, Oshawa Art Association, Cultural Leadership Council and two residents assisted with the development of the PAMP from the initial conceptual stages to reviewing the draft PAMP.

Presentations were delivered to each advisory committee (Heritage Oshawa, Active Transportation, Environment and Accessibility) and feedback obtained during the community consultation phase.

A presentation was delivered to the Cultural Leadership Council during the consultation phase and feedback obtained.

Other municipal colleagues, Public Art Master Plans, tools, initiatives and programs consulted included:

- Town of Newmarket
- City of Kingston
- City of Mississauga
- City of Burlington
- City of Hamilton
- City of Nanaimo
- City of Calgary
- District of Maple Ridge
- Town of Pelham
- City of Thunder Bay
- Town of Kitchener
- Strathcona County
- City of Toronto
- City of Vancouver
- City of Winnipeg
- City of Montreal
- City of Ottawa
- City of Melbourne

5.0 Analysis

5.1 Background – Culture Counts: Oshawa’s Arts, Culture and Heritage Plan

In 2014, Oshawa approved its first cultural plan: Culture Counts: Oshawa’s Art, Culture and Heritage Plan (‘Culture Counts’). Within Culture Counts, the strategic direction to “Create Vibrant Places and Spaces” contains action items specific to developing Oshawa’s Public Art Program:

- Review the City’s existing mural program.
- Finalize and implement the Oshawa Public Art Policy and Program
- Establish a Public Art Committee to manage juried competitions for the City.
- Establish a Public Art Fund.

Since 2014, both the actions items to develop the Public Art Policy (2015) and the creation of the Public Art Task Force/ Committee (2017) have been executed.

The Public Art Master Plan addresses the remaining two action items relating to reviewing the mural program and a establishing a Public Art Fund.

5.2 Plan Development

In collaboration with the Public Art Task Force and the Staff Working Group, the development of the Oshawa's PAMP took place over three phases between September 2017 and June 2018.

The first phase of the development of the PAMP involved convening the internal staff team, reviewing internal documents, researching other municipalities and engaging the PATF.

Significant research was conducted on other municipal Public Art Master Plans which provided staff insight as to what objectives Oshawa would require with its PAMP. Staff reviewed other municipal PAMP, community engagement frameworks, associated policies and tools from a range of municipalities, and connected with colleagues, including Town of Newmarket, Town of Kingston, City of Mississauga, City of Burlington, City of Hamilton, Town of Lethbridge, City of Nanaimo, City of Calgary, District of Maple Ridge, City of Moscow (Idaho), Town of Pelham, City of Thunder Bay, Town of Kitchener, City of Chicago, Strathcona County, City of Ashland (Oregon).

Other tools and publications used to inform the development of Oshawa's Public Art Master Plan included the University of Toronto/ OCAD research collaboration report "Redefining Public Art in Toronto" (2017) and the Creative Cities Network of Canada "Public Art Toolkit" (2010).

The second phase of the development of the PAMP involved developing and executing the Community Engagement and Consultation process (See Report section 5.3 for more details).

The third phase of the development of the PAMP involved reviewing all the research, analyzing the feedback from community engagement and drafting the plan.

5.3 Community Connections

To collect and assess the public's perception and aspirations for Public Art in Oshawa, three forms of community engagement and consultation were implemented during the period of March 14 to April 12, 2018: Online and hard copy Survey, Public Art Cafes, and Public Art Pop Ups.

132 people answered the Online Survey and 18 additional people filled in the survey in paper format. Over 500 people in total participated in the survey, Public Art Cafés and Pop-Ups resulting in 678 pins placed on maps (digital and hard copy) with over 200 unique locations throughout the City being identified.

Recreation and Culture Services led six (6) Public Art Cafes at recreation facilities and ten (10) Pop-ups at non-city owned facilities across the City, ensuring that consultation took place in highly populated areas and frequently used locations in the City and allowed for engagement to be made with a range of demographics. The Public Art Cafés and Pop Ups activities were based on the survey questions and allowed participants to drop-in and complete activities at their leisure.

In addition, presentations to each advisory committee and the Cultural Leadership Council were completed.

Participants saw Public Art as a means to beautify the city: “Dress it up with colour and visual interest!”, “make it more welcoming,” and add culture, history and “life to otherwise plain areas.” They also perceived Public Art as a more democratic form of art, since it could be found all over the city. As one person commented, “Not just at places where only high income folks live; art needs to be everywhere, especially in places where folks who have low incomes may access it on a regular basis”. Many were interested in having Public Art in natural settings such as parks and trails. One person’s reasoning was “nature and art are vital for the human spirit. The further we get away from that the less happy people get.”

5.4 Vision for Public Art in Oshawa

Based on the community consultation feedback where the values and beliefs of participants were articulated, City staff with support from the Public Art Task Force developed the following vision statement for Public Art in Oshawa:

“Oshawa will be a community where Public Art is innovative, diverse, and accessible to create vibrant public spaces and meaningful connections.”

Public Art has the ability to transform a neighbourhood, evoke connections between people and place, stimulate local economy and turn ordinary infrastructure into unique elements that not only excite but also create identity in where residents live, work and play.

5.5 Site Criteria and Site Selection

Over 200 unique and specific locations were identified by the public through the community engagement and consultation. Each location offers a unique opportunity to install art however not all locations are suitable and not all sites would maximize the City’s investment in Public Art. In order to adequately assess and set priorities, a set of Site Criteria was developed. City staff reviewed the locations identified and determined that the site needs to maximize the following objectives:

- High visibility and public accessibility
- Cultural and/or historical significance to the community
- High response rate during the public consultation
- Greater opportunity to link with other City projects (e.g. capital projects, special events)

Additionally, a Site Scoring Tool was developed which further evaluated and gave a grade to a site based on the following criteria: Pedestrian Use, Vehicular Traffic, Dedicated Funding, Capital Project Association, Public Support, Site Lines and Surroundings and Historical and Cultural Significance.

5.6 Proposed Zones, Locations and Sites

Once analyzed, five Zones emerged as the priority areas for future Public Art installations. Within each Zone there are specific areas with associated locations. The PAMP prioritizes city-owned facilities, infrastructure and spaces and as such the locations below reflect that prioritization.

However, throughout the community engagement and consultation there was a significant number of sites identified that were located on private and non-city owned lands. It is recognized that it would be worthwhile to investigate opportunities with private land owners as well as regional and provincial authorities to determine if partnership is possible on future Public Art projects.

The Zones and the associated City-owned facility and/ or space include:

- Zone 1 – Downtown (Ward 4): City Hall, Arts Resource Centre, Memorial Park
- Zone 2: Trails and Waterfront
 - Michael Starr Trail (Ward 4 and 5): Alexandra Park, Connaught Park, Centennial Park, Sunnyside Park, and Bloor Parkette
 - Joseph Kolodzie Oshawa Creek Bike Path and Trail (Ward 4 and 5): Oshawa Valley Botanical Gardens (OVBG) Brick Valley Park and Rotary Park Southmead Park and Bloor Parkette.
 - Lakefront Area/ Waterfront Trail (Ward 5): Lakeview Park, Waterfront Trail, Lakefront West Park, South Oshawa Community Centre, and Stone Street Park.
- Zone 3: Corridors
 - Northview Area (Ward 2 and 3): Northview Community Centre, North Oshawa Park and Skatepark
 - Harmony Corridor (Ward 3): King and Bond intersection, Donevan Recreation Complex, Easton Park, and Farewell Park
 - Wentworth Corridor (Ward 5): no city-owned facilities or spaces were identified in this area
- Zone 4: Gateways into the City
 - Exits off the 401(Ward 5) and 407 (Simcoe/ Winchester) (Ward 1 & 2) were noted however partnership with provincial and regional governments would be required at these locations
- Zone 5 - Legends Centre and Northern Community (Ward 1): Legends Centre

5.7 Mural Program Review

The City of Oshawa currently has 17 murals located in the downtown area. The majority of these murals were created in the mid-1990s to early 2000s.

The feedback obtained from the PAMP community consultation indicated a strong desire for more murals of a contemporary nature be created. Many of the locations identified in Zone 1: Downtown were linked to walls that would be suitable for mural creation however many of the locations identified were not city-owned facilities or spaces. City staff conducted research into other municipal initiatives and approaches for new mural creation and promotion. It is recommended that these opportunities be reviewed further and implemented as appropriate. Initiatives include:

- creating incentive grants or cost sharing programs (e.g. would allow for partnership with private land owners)
- developing more creative zones (e.g. authorizing other graffiti walls similar to Donevan Recreation Complex)
- hosting a Mural Festival
- designating an area as an Open Air Urban Art Museum
- examining the Sign By-Law to reduce barriers which would allow for the creation of artistic murals on private lands.

Since the mid-1990s, the City has been repairing murals in the event of vandalism and graffiti. In 2017, City staff conducted a conservation review of the murals where each mural was assessed and its condition documented from poor to excellent. The life expectancy of a mural is between 10-20 years. Many of Oshawa's murals are beyond their life expectancy and require a case-by-case approach as to whether they should be repaired or permanently removed/ disposed. In some cases, the cost to repair the mural is beyond the cost-benefit and a new mural should be considered for that location.

Additionally, each location should be reviewed to determine the appropriate arrangement (e.g. ownership, terms and conditions of hosting a mural) with the current land owner and if the location is still suitable to host a mural. Due to the complexity relating to disposing of a mural, it is recommended that City staff create a De-Accession (Disposal) Procedure specific to murals that allows for the individual assessment of each mural and the necessary steps to ensure that disposal is undertaken appropriately.

5.8 Roles and Responsibilities

The PAMP identifies the key roles and responsibilities in order to deliver the vision and recommendations. The role and responsibilities of Oshawa City Council, Recreation and Culture Services staff, the Public Art Task Force (PATF) as well as a Public Art Staff Team have been defined.

The responsibilities identified demonstrate a transparent and professional approach to the oversight of the Public Art Program. This approach allows for appropriate planning, budgeting, thoughtful artist selection processes, reduces duplication, and ultimately avoids the acquisition and implementation of artworks that are not in the City's best interest.

5.9 Proposed Funding Model

Known costs associated to past Public Art initiatives in Oshawa have included the 17 murals located in the downtown core. When overseen by the Downtown Action Committee, the mural creation budget in 1995 consisted of \$60,000 annually which allowed for four murals to be created. This budget was then reduced to \$20,000 in 1998 enabling only one mural to be created.

Commissioned and purchased by the City in 2011, 'Oshawa Rising', a sculpture by Ron Baird, located in City Hall had an associated cost of \$9,000 that covered the artist fees, installation and materials. The 88 Keys Project in 2015 involved the City commissioning three artists to transform pianos, which had a total project budget for all three pianos of \$7,500. Although commissioned and purchased by the Robert McLaughlin Gallery in 2015, 'Reverb' by Noel Harding, located outside of the Tribute Communities Centre, had an associated cost of \$150,000 which included artist fees, architectural/ structural design fees, installation and materials. The City of Oshawa provided in-kind support relating to the use and preparation of the land. These amounts provide a baseline for what types of costs would be associated to implement future Public Art projects.

Based on costs associated to past projects and in order to implement the Public Art Master Plan (PAMP), securing funding for public artworks would require two types of investments:

- Public Art Acquisition Funds – relates to the initial investment to acquire the artwork
- Public Art Maintenance and Conservation Funds – relates to the investment for the ongoing care and conservation of the artwork

In order to acquire and care for future temporary/ semi-permanent and permanent artworks, two separate funding methods should be considered and adopted.

It is recommended that \$20,000 through the annual budget process would be needed to acquire and implement Public Art projects that are small-scale temporary or semi-permanent (life cycle of 3 years or less). Projects could include a utility box program, banner program, and vinyl art projects. This funding would also be used to expand the Downtown Mural Program.

In addition, an annual contribution for maintenance and conservation (for temporary and semi-permanent Public Art) would be \$2,000. This amount represents 10% of the annual acquisition budget which is a typical percent amount applied in many municipalities for maintenance and conservation.

In order to be able to acquire and maintain larger-scale Public Art whose life cycle is 10 or more years, annual contributions to reserve would be required.

It is recommended that an annual contribution to reserve for the acquisition of new large scale Public Art and its maintenance and long-term care be \$60,000. This would allow for large-scale Public Art projects to be initiated and implemented approximately every 3-5 years depending on the scope of the project.

The recommended funding strategy would result in an \$82,000 increase to the annual tax levy requirement if approved.

It is also recommended that the existing annual \$7,000 Arts and Culture Reserve contribution be dedicated to fund the maintenance and conservation of art acquired prior to 2019.

Other potential sources of funding that staff will continue to investigate include donations, sponsorship, grants and cost-sharing programs with private and non-city owned land owners.

5.10 Implementation of the Public Art Master Plan

In order to achieve the Vision and Zone locations set out in the Public Art Master Plan, action items have been grouped into the areas of administration, education and promotion and project development.

These action items range from creating procedural documents, conducting further research on best practices to creating opportunities and incentive programs and implementing specific public art projects.

The timeline to execute action items range from Early (Year 1 – 3), Mid (Year 3-5) and Long Term (Year 7-10) and will take place over the next 10 years.

5.11 Next Steps

If approved, RCS staff will convene the Public Art Staff Team and the Public Art Task Force to begin the implementation of action items identified in the Public Art Master Plan. City staff would initiate the necessary steps to implement the Funding Model through the request for budget funding commencing in 2019. It is proposed that the annual and reserve contributions would begin in 2019 and continue on an annual basis.

6.0 Financial Implications

There are no immediate financial implications to approve the Public Art Master Plan.

The 2019 budget would include a request for funding to implement temporary/ semi-permanent Public Art at \$22,000 in annual operating funding.

The 2019 budget would also include a request for funding to support future large-scale Public Art at \$60,000 in annual contribution to reserve.

Additionally, City staff will monitor the acquisition and maintenance of Public Art and assess its impact to other areas (e.g. staffing, programming, marketing) and determine if additional funding is required. This will be analyzed on an annual basis and any funding requests to support these growth areas will occur via the annual budget process.

7.0 Relationship to the Oshawa Strategic Plan

This report addresses the Oshawa Strategic Plan by responding to the goal of “Cultural Vitality” and the related theme to “Enrich Our Community Through Culture” by creating vibrant places and spaces and to broaden and evolve the City’s role in arts, culture and heritage.



Jim Naumovski, Director,
Recreation & Culture Services



Ron Diskey, Commissioner,
Community Services Department